



Shengping Zhang <sup>1</sup>, Chen Yu <sup>1</sup>, Jingyi Tan <sup>2</sup>, Yuxin Wang <sup>1</sup>, and Zhen He <sup>1,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> School of Materials Science and Engineering, Jiangsu University of Science and Technology,
- Zhenjiang 212100, China; zsp960920@163.com (S.Z.); yuchen080797@163.com (C.Y.); ywan943@163.com (Y.W.)
  <sup>2</sup> School of Health, Guangzhou Xinhua University, Guangzhou 510520, China; jytan1204@163.com

\* Correspondence: hezhen@just.edu.cn

**Abstract:** In this study, Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes were produced using a sol-enhanced electrodeposition technique from methanesulfonate electrolytes. The surface microstructures of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> were observed, and their phase constituents were determined. The surface features were analyzed by X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy. Linear sweep voltammetry and degradation tests were also conducted to determine the degradation performance. The results show that the addition of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol affects the microstructures of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes, while a uniform coating surface can be obtained at a proper sol concentration in electrolytes. Adding TiO<sub>2</sub> sol also causes deep oxidation of Sb and generates more adsorbed oxygen on the electrode surface. The favorable surface features and the well-dispersed TiO<sub>2</sub> in the coatings of 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes award them the best electrocatalytic performance, and their uniform coating surface prolongs the electrode service life.

Keywords: SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>; sol-enhanced electrodeposition; organic degradation



**Citation:** Zhang, S.; Yu, C.; Tan, J.; Wang, Y.; He, Z. Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> Electrodeposited from Methanesulfonate Electrolytes: Preparation, Properties, and Performance. *Coatings* **2022**, *12*, 366. https://doi.org/10.3390/ coatings12030366

Academic Editor: László A. Péter

Received: 9 February 2022 Accepted: 7 March 2022 Published: 9 March 2022

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2022 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

# 1. Introduction

The demand for effective effluents treatment technology has raised increasing research interests under growing public concern in environmental issues. The treatment of poorly biodegradable organics is essential in the effluents treatment industry. Advanced electrochemical oxidation technology (AEOT) is considered to be a promising method to deal with this issue, owing to its advantages in efficiency and flexibility [1–3]. Organic degradation reactions mostly occur on the anode surface, which plays a crucial role in the electrochemical treatment process. The primary anode materials applied in effluent treatment technology are precious metals (Pt, Au, etc.), carbon, boron-doped diamond (BDD), and metal oxide electrodes [4–6].

Titanium-supported antimony-tin oxide (Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>) is a type of metal oxide electrode that can suppress the oxygen evolution reaction (OER) in order to allow for the effective degradation of organics by hydroxyl radicals. Originally, SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> was utilized as a catalyst for organic conversion, whereas this mixed oxide was recently employed as an anode coating due to its adequate conductivity and chemical resistance. Moreover, SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> can be efficiently and economically coated on a Ti substrate, making it into large areas for industrial applications. The inert Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> electrodes, therefore, show unique advantages in effluent treatment technology due to their low preparation cost compared to precious metal and BDD, high OER potential, and solid electrocatalytic ability.

The conventional fabrication route for the  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  electrode is thermal decomposition, in which, the precursor solution is transformed into  $SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  after calcination [7]. However, the inferior stability and inadequate electrocatalytic ability limit the scale-up application of  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  electrodes made from thermal decomposition. The electrodeposition fabrication route was recently proposed to manufacture  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  electrodes. However, despite an enhanced stability, the electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  electrode suffers from a relatively low electrocatalytic performance.

Previous literature has investigated various modification methods for electrode performance enhancement. Venkatesha et al. [8] and Wang et al. [9] constructed a porous  $SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  coating based on anodized TiO\_2 nanotubes, boosting the electrode electrocatalytic performance and long-term stability. Chen et al. [10] synthesized the dense spherical Ti/Sb–SnO<sub>2</sub> with a superior electrocatalytic performance using colloidal electrodeposition. Moreover, doping other elements and nanoparticles could effectively modify the electrodeposited Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> [11]. Liu et al. [12] and Qiao et al. [13] fabricated the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>–Ce electrodes for efficient electrocatalytic oxidation. Wu et al. [14] prepared a high-performance duplex-structured Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-CNT composite anode using the electrodeposition method. In our recent studies, a sol-enhanced electrodeposition method has been proposed to efficiently dope inert nanoparticles and achieve their well-dispersion into the coating [15–18], which can serve as a promising method for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> modification.

This work explores the sol-enhanced electrodeposition route for the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes in methanesulfonate electrolytes. Compared to the traditional oxidizing sulfuric sources, the methanesulfonate electrolyte better reveals the advantages of a low toxicity, excellent chemical stability, and outstanding biodegradability [19–21]. The influence of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol addition on the electrode's properties and performance is systematically investigated. We propose a novel modification procedure for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>, which will benefit the scale-up application for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> in the effluent treatment industry. We also aim to thoroughly unveil the underlying mechanism and potential of its electrodeposition fabrication route.

#### 2. Materials and Methods

# 2.1. Preparation of $Ti/SnO_2$ - $Sb_2O_x$ - $TiO_2$

The analytical grade chemicals were bought from Aladdin Reagent, Shanghai, China. A pure titanium (99.9%) plate was used in our work. The titanium substrate was pretreated as described in the procedures below: (1) grinding and polishing; (2) soaking into 15% wt sodium hydroxide (NaOH) solution for 2 h; and (3) soaking in 12% wt oxalic acid solution for 3 h. The TiO<sub>2</sub> sol was prepared as reported in the previous papers [22,23].

The proposed  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  electrodes were fabricated from the electrodeposition method. The electrodeposition fabrication route consists of the electrodeposition process and the following heat-treatment process.

In the electrodeposition process, the electrolyte consisted of 60 mL/L tin methanesulfonate ( $C_2H_6O_6S_2Sn$ , 50% wt in  $H_2O$ ), 50 mL/L methane sulfonic acid ( $CH_4O_3S$ , 99%), antimony trichloride (SbCl<sub>3</sub>, 99%), 2 g/L gelatin, and 2 g/L hydroquinone. The electrodes were prepared in an electrolytic cell as follows: the tin plate (40 mm × 40 mm) was used as the anode and the pretreated titanium substrate (20 mm × 30 mm × 0.1 mm) was used as the cathode. TiO<sub>2</sub> sol was prepared following the procedures in previous work [24–26]. A certain amount (5, 10, 15 mL/L) of as-prepared TiO<sub>2</sub> sol was slowly dropped into the stirring electrolytes. The electrodeposition was carried out at a current density of 30 mA/cm<sup>2</sup> for 20 min at 30 °C, and the electrolyte was stirred at 300 rpm. Then, in the heat treatment process, the samples were heat-treated in a muffle furnace at temperatures of 600 °C for 10 h to obtain the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes. The thickness of electrodeposited SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> coating was ~26 µm, whereas TiO<sub>2</sub> sol addition hardly modified the coating thickness.

The Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> was also made by the traditional dip-coating method for comparison. Firstly, the pretreated titanium substrate was dipped into a mixture of 1.8 g of tin tetrachloride (SnCl<sub>4</sub>), 2 mL of antimony oxide (Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>), and 8 mL of isopropyl alcohol for 15 s, followed by a drying treatment at 100 °C for 10 min and then a heating treatment in a muffle furnace for 10 min at 600 °C. The drying and heating treatment process was repeated six times, and, finally, the titanium substrate was placed in a muffle furnace for ten hours at 600 °C to acquire the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>.

## 2.2. Structural and Elemental Characterization

X-ray diffraction (XRD-6000X, Shimazu, Kyoto, Japan) identified the phase constituents at a step size of  $0.1^{\circ}$ /s. The surface morphology was observed by a scanning electron microscope (SEM, Phenom ProX, Eindhoven, The Netherlands) with an energy dispersive spectroscopy (EDS) detector, and the embedded simulation program completed the 3D surface imaging. The X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS, ESCALAB 250Xi, Thermo Fisher, Waltham, MA, USA) was utilized to analyze elemental details, during which, Al K $\alpha$  radiation at 1486.6 eV was used.

### 2.3. Electrochemical and Degradation Tests

The electrochemical performance of the electrode was tested by linear sweep voltammetry (LSV) using an electrochemical workstation (CH660E, Chenhua Instrument, Shanghai, China). A three-electrode system was used in the tests. Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrode (10 mm  $\times$  10 mm) was the working electrode. Platinum plate (20 mm  $\times$  20 mm) was the counter electrode, and saturated calomel electrode (SCE) was the reference electrode. A 0.25 mol/L Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> solution was used as the electrolyte solution. The scan range was from 0 to 4 V, at a scanning rate of 20 mV/s.

The benzoic acid degradation experiment was carried out in 100 mg/L benzoic acid solution at a volume of 200 mL. We used the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrode (20 mm  $\times$  30 mm) as the anode and the same-sized titanium sheet as the cathode. A direct current power was employed to control the current density at 40 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>, and the 300-rpm magnetic stirring was applied. The target solution sample was taken for detection after a certain degradation period. The degradation process was monitored using high-performance liquid chromatography (HPLC, Nexera, Shimadzu, Kyoto, Japan) equipped with a TC-C18 column. The mobile phase consisted of 90% water (0.1% trifluoroacetic acid) and 10% acetonitrile. The accelerated life was tested in 0.25 mol/L Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> at room temperature at 100 mA/cm<sup>2</sup>. The prepared sample was the anode, and a titanium sheet was the cathode. The accelerated lifetime was calculated when the potential steeply raised and exceeded 5.0 V.

# 3. Results and Discussion

# 3.1. Structural Characterizations

Figure 1 presents the XRD profiles of  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  and  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  electrodes. The electrode prepared by the conventional dip-coating method reveals broad  $SnO_2$  peaks, which indicates a large extent of the amorphous phase. In addition, the sharp Ti peaks imply the exposure of underneath titanium substrate. Such an observation is in good agreement with previous literature [7,27]. In contrast, distinct phase constituents are attained for these samples from the electrodeposition fabrication route. The crystallinity substantially increases, and several intense peaks of tetragonal rutile  $SnO_2$  (JCPDS 99-0024) are discovered. Similar phenomena have also been reported in some earlier literature [7].

The incorporation of TiO<sub>2</sub> addition affects the phase composition significantly. When the TiO<sub>2</sub> addition was  $\leq 10 \text{ mL/L}$ , the SnO<sub>2</sub> peak intensity sharply decreases, which indicates a refinement for the prepared SnO<sub>2</sub> crystallites. As summarized in Table 1, the grain size of SnO<sub>2</sub> is estimated according to the Scherrer equation through full width at half maximum (FWHM) [28]. The results show that adding 10 mL/L sol leads to a significantly decreased grain size, whereas larger grains form when further increasing the TiO<sub>2</sub> sol concertation to 15 mL/L. During the electrodeposition process, the TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles are in situ generated and then co-deposited to generate SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>. These welldispersed nanoparticles can serve as active sites for crystallite nucleation, thereby providing a driving force for nucleation and forming smaller SnO<sub>2</sub> crystallites [29]. However, the sharp SnO<sub>2</sub> peaks show an opposite phase variation at a 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> concentration. Under this condition, the generated TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles tend to aggregate and decrease the active sites in the electrodeposition. It is noted that no TiO<sub>2</sub> diffraction peak is detected in the composite coatings due to the limited amount of embedded TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles.



**Figure 1.** (a) XRD profiles recorded on the  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> with different concentrations of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol, and (b) the EDS results recorded on the electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>.

Table 1. Estimated grain size of SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> prepared at different TiO<sub>2</sub> sol additions.

TiO <sub>2</sub> Sol Addition	0 mL/L	10 mL/L	15 mL/L
Grain size (nm)	60	28	45

Figure 1b presents the elemental analysis recorded on the electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$ , proving the existence of antimony in the deposited coatings. The ratio of Sn/Sb is ~8 wt.% in  $SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$ , which is in good agreement with previous reports [7,30]. Such antimony content in the lattice provides good conductivity for the prepared electrode.

The surface microstructures of prepared Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> are presented in Figure 2. A typical mud-like coating surface is obtained using the conventional dip-coating method, as shown in Figure 2a. The cracks and holes in such coating surfaces could damage the electrode stability due to the oxide generation in the electrolysis process [7]. In the meantime, the electrodeposited Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> demonstrates a different surface morphology, showing a relatively compact coating surface with a much-improved uniformity. An increased addition of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol ( $\leq 10$  mL/L) gives rise to a more compact surface, whereas an



addition of 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> sol causes a relatively non-uniform surface morphology due to the nanoparticle's aggregation.

**Figure 2.** The surface morphologies of (**a**) Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> made by traditional dip-coating, and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodeposited with different additions of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol: (**b**) 0 mL/L (**c**) 5 mL/L, (**d**) 10 mL/L, and (**e**) 15 mL/L (insets are the corresponding Sn-Sb-TiO<sub>2</sub> coatings before the heat treatment process).

A similar morphologic variation can be seen for the Sn-Sb-TiO<sub>2</sub> layers before the heattreatment process, as shown in the inset images. The TiO<sub>2</sub> addition refines the surface morphology of Sn-Sb-TiO<sub>2</sub> at a TiO<sub>2</sub> sol concentration  $\leq 10$  mL/L, whereas an excessive sol concentration caused relatively non-uniform morphology. The surface structures of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes are highly associated with the early electrodeposited Sn-Sb-TiO<sub>2</sub> layers, with some features remaining after the oxidation reactions during heat treatment.

The surface features were further characterized by a 3D imaging technique, as shown in Figure 3. These images show the surface roughness and uniformity for the electrode-posited samples. The proper addition of  $TiO_2$  sol brings a more uniform and compact surface, depicted in Figure 3b,c. The observation corresponds with our earlier XRD and

SEM findings, which proves that the 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> sol addition refines the surface with a decreased crystallite size and leads to a relatively open surface morphology with an improved uniformity. Nevertheless, the 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> addition causes a non-uniform coating surface, depicted in Figure 3d.



**Figure 3.** The 3D-imaging surface (depicted with heat map) for the prepared  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> samples electrodeposited with different additions of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol: (**a**) 0 mL/L, (**b**) 5 mL/L, (**c**) 10 mL/L, (**d**) 15 mL/L.

# 3.2. Elemental and LSV Analysis

The elemental analysis characterizes the electrodeposited samples, as shown in Figure 4. Figure 4a shows the overall spectra of the electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  and  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  samples, where prominent peaks of Sb and Sn are detected. The presence of Ti peaks in Figure 4b proves the successful incorporation of  $TiO_2$  into the prepared  $SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$  coatings, whereas the  $SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  sample shows no Ti peak. The weak Ti peaks correlate with the limited content of  $TiO_2$  existing on the electrode surface. During the sol-enhanced electrodeposition, the  $TiO_2$  nanoparticles are in situ generated in electrolytes. The attached organic chains avoid the agglomeration of nanoparticles, which are then co-deposited in the coating with excellent dispersion.

Figure 4c,d compare the spectra of Sb and O on the electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$ and  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x-TiO_2$ . The results elaborate in detail on the state of antinomy oxide and absorbed oxygen with and without  $TiO_2$  sol addition. Both  $Sb^{3+}$  and  $Sb^{5+}$  exist in the prepared coatings, indicating that there are two oxidation states for antinomy after the heat treatment process. In addition, the detected oxygen can be categorized as  $O_{lat}$  (i.e., lattice oxygen species) and  $O_{ads}$  (hydroxyl oxygen species), which matches with previous studies [13,31].



**Figure 4.** XPS spectra of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> (10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> sol addition): (a) the overall spectra, (b) Ti spectra for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>, (c) Sb, O spectra for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>, and (d) Sb, O spectra for Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>.

Table 2 summarizes the comparison between the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> in XPS analysis. The listed atom ratios of  $O_{ads}/O_{lat}$  and Sb<sup>5+</sup>/Sb<sup>3+</sup> provide a qualitative judgment for the element variation. The atom ratio of  $O_{ads}/O_{lat}$  is higher in Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>. It is noted that adsorbed oxygen is a potent oxidizing agent. In the meantime, the Sb 3d3/2 is split into two oxidation states, Sb<sup>5+</sup> and Sb<sup>3+</sup>, respectively. The higher ratio of Sb<sup>5+</sup>/Sb<sup>3+</sup> implies that deeper surface oxidation occurs in the heat treatment process. The higher valence of Sb generally offers more excessive electrons and functions as dominant donors for the SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb semiconductor, improving the conductivity of the prepared electrode [32]. The natural donors of oxygen vacancies are inhibited simultaneously, and the lattice oxygen is reduced. To conclude, the results imply that the addition of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol can help to generate favorable surface features of the chemical composition and oxygen state for the improved electrocatalytic performance.

Table 2. Calculated atom ratios for  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> and  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>.

Comulas	Atom	Ratio
Samples —	Sb <sup>5+</sup> :Sb <sup>3+</sup>	O <sub>ads</sub> :O <sub>lat</sub>
0 mL TiO <sub>2</sub> sol sample	1.13	0.49
$10 \text{ mL TiO}_2$ sol sample	1.34	0.78

Figure 5 presents the linear sweep voltammetry recorded on the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>. The oxygen evolution reaction (OER) potential decreases in the order below: 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample (2.34 V) > 5 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample (2.27 V) > 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample (2.19 V) > 0 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample (2.15 V). The picture indicates that adding a certain TiO<sub>2</sub> sol increases the electrode's OER potential. When the amount of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol increases to 15 mL/L, the OER potential shows a downward tendency, resulting from the nanoparticle aggregation in the coating [33]. In general, the effective organic degradation process favors a high OER potential, which avoids the OER (i.e., the side-reaction) in the electrolysis process.



Figure 5. LSV results of electrodeposited Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> and Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>.

# 3.3. The Degradation Performance of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> Electrodes

The electrocatalytic performance of the prepared electrode was studied by degradation tests, as demonstrated in Figure 6. Benzoic acid (BA) is a typical organic pollutant used as a target in degradation tests. The results show that adding TiO<sub>2</sub> sol influences the electrocatalytic ability. The degradation performance decreases following the order below: 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample > 5 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample > 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample > 0 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample. After the 10 h electrolysis, 98% BA is electrochemically combusted by the 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrodes, whereas only 79% BA is degraded on the non-doped sample in the same duration.

Figure 6b shows the kinetic fitting curve of benzoic acid concentration with degradation time. The logarithm of benzoic acid concentration and degradation time showed a good linear relationship during the degradation process, which proved that the degradation process of benzoic acid follows the primary reaction kinetic model:

$$\ln\left(\frac{C_0}{C_t}\right) = kt \tag{1}$$

where  $C_0$  represents the initial concentration of benzoic acid,  $C_t$  represents the concentration of benzoic acid at a specific moment, and k is the reaction rate constant. Table 3 lists the calculated k value for the degradation process on different electrodes. The larger k value of the 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample represents the electrode's faster degradation rate of benzoic acid.



**Figure 6.** (a) The benzoic concentration after a certain duration of degradation on different electrodes, (b) the fitted curve for the BA degradation process, where  $C_t$  is the BA concentration and  $C_0$  is the initial BA concentration.

**Table 3.** Degradation ability of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes with different concentrations of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol in electrolytes, where k is kinetics coefficients.

	0 mL/L TiO <sub>2</sub>	5 mL/L TiO <sub>2</sub>	10 mL/L TiO <sub>2</sub>	15 mL/L TiO <sub>2</sub>
K (min <sup>-1</sup> )	$2.87  imes 10^{-3}$	$4.64 imes10^{-3}$	$5.75  imes 10^{-3}$	$3.09  imes 10^{-3}$

The results prove that the proper addition of  $TiO_2$  sol enhances the electrocatalytic performance of  $Ti/SnO_2$ -Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes. In general, the electrochemical combustion of organics is achieved by the hydroxyl radicals—a robust oxidizing agent that breaks the

chemical bonds and finally turns the organic into  $H_2O$  and  $CO_2$ . The organic degradation pathway is proposed as follows in Equations (2) and (3) [13,34]:

$$SnO_2 + H_2O \rightarrow SnO_2 (OH)_{ads} + H^+ + e$$
 (2)

$$R + SnO_2 (OH)_{ads} \rightarrow SnO_2 + H^+ + e + Oxidation \text{ products (such as } CO_2)$$
(3)

where R stands for the organic and  $(OH)_{ads}$  stands for the physic-adsorbed hydroxyl radicals. The higher content of Sb<sup>5+</sup> increases the electrode conductivity and helps to generate surface adsorbed oxygen species. Besides, the uniform electrode surface with numerous peaks and valleys could provide many active sites for degradation reactions for the 5 and 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified electrodes. The well-dispersed TiO<sub>2</sub> nanoparticles also offer additional reaction sites, further improving the degradation ability for the TiO<sub>2</sub> sol-enhanced electrodes. As for the 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrode, both the superior surface feature and well-dispersed TiO<sub>2</sub> award it the best electrocatalytic performance in the examined samples.

Accelerated life tests were also conducted to investigate the electrode performance, as shown in Figure 7, comprehensively. The dip-coated  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  electrode was tested for comparison, which shows an inferior long-term stability due to its open surface structure being vulnerable to corrosion attack. During the degradation process, the corrosion attack results in the generation of titanium oxide, a non-conductive inert material that inhibits the degradation process and causes coating defoliation.



**Figure 7.** The accelerated service life results, (**a**) the tested accelerated service life for samples preprepared by dip-coating and sol-enhanced electrodeposition with different  $TiO_2$  sol concentrations, (**b**) surface morphology of electrodeposited  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$  after 2 h test, and (**c**) surface morphology of  $Ti/SnO_2-Sb_2O_x$ - $TiO_2$  (10 mL/L  $TiO_2$  sol doped) after 2 h test.

The electrodeposited Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> shows a much-improved stability in the accelerated life tests. A relatively compact coating fully covers underneath the Ti substrate for these samples. An increasing TiO<sub>2</sub> addition gradually prolongs the accelerated life at a concentration less than 10 mL/L. Figure 7b,c demonstrate the surface morphology of the undoped sample and 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> sol modified samples after 2 h accelerated life tests. The undoped SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub> coating is almost peeled off from the substrate, whereas the electrolysis process only slightly changes the surface morphology of the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrode.

The electrode stability is highly correlated to the different morphologic features. The proper addition of  $TiO_2$  sol leads to a uniform surface with fewer cracks and holes, thereby improving the electrode stability. Moreover, well-dispersed nanoparticles in the coating can prevent corrosion penetration and enhance the corrosion resistance for electrodes. In contrast, excessive  $TiO_2$  addition harms the coating uniformity due to the nanoparticle aggregation, negatively affecting the electrode stability.

### 4. Conclusions

This study develops the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes by applying sol-enhanced electrodeposition from methanesulfonate electrolytes. The results show that adding TiO<sub>2</sub> sol affects the surface morphologies of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrodes. A uniform coating surface can be obtained at a suitable sol addition. Furthermore, the addition of TiO<sub>2</sub> sol leads to deep oxidation of Sb and helps to generate more adsorbed oxygen. The organic degradation performance decreases in the following order: 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> sol modified sample > 5 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample > 15 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample > 0 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified sample. The favored surface feature and well-dispersed TiO<sub>2</sub> in the 10 mL/L TiO<sub>2</sub> modified Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>x</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> electrode results in the best electrocatalytic performance in the examined samples, and its uniform coating surface with fewer cracks and holes prolong the electrode service life.

**Author Contributions:** Investigation, S.Z.; methodology, C.Y.; writing—review and editing, J.T.; validation, Y.W.; writing—original draft preparation, Z.H. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This work was supported by the Natural Science Foundation of Jiangsu Province under Grant BK20201008, the Key Research Project of Zhenjiang under Grant GJ2020014.

Institutional Review Board Statement: Not applicable.

Informed Consent Statement: Not applicable.

Data Availability Statement: Not applicable.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

# References

- 1. Salazar-Banda, G.R.; Santos, G.d.O.S.; Duarte Gonzaga, I.M.; Dória, A.R.; Barrios Eguiluz, K.I. Developments in electrode materials for wastewater treatment. *Curr. Opin. Electrochem.* **2021**, *26*, 100663. [CrossRef]
- Tan, X.; Zhao, Y.; Sun, W.; Jin, C.; Chen, L.; Wei, H.; Sun, C. Three-dimensional hierarchically porous PbO<sub>2</sub> electrode for electrochemical degradation of m-cresol. *J. Electroanal. Chem.* 2020, 856, 113726. [CrossRef]
- 3. Syam Babu, D.; Nidheesh, P. A review on electrochemical treatment of arsenic from aqueous medium. *Chem. Eng. Commun.* 2020, 208, 1–22. [CrossRef]
- Wu, W.; Huang, Z.-H.; Lim, T.-T. Recent development of mixed metal oxide anodes for electrochemical oxidation of organic pollutants in water. *Appl. Catal. A Gen.* 2014, 480, 58–78. [CrossRef]
- Chaplin, B.P. Critical review of electrochemical advanced oxidation processes for water treatment applications. *Environ. Sci.* Process. Impacts 2014, 16, 1182–1203. [CrossRef]
- 6. Feng, Y.; Yang, L.; Liu, J.; Logan, B.E. Electrochemical technologies for wastewater treatment and resource reclamation. *Environ. Sci. Water Res. Technol.* **2016**, *2*, 800–831. [CrossRef]
- Ni, Q. Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> as an Anode Material in Electro-Oxidation of Organic Compounds for Wastewater Treatment. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada, 2016.

- Rao, A.N.S.; Venkatarangaiah, V.T. Preparation, characterization, and application of Ti/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode in photoelectrochemical treatment of industrial effluents under mild conditions. *Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res.* 2018, 25, 11480–11492. [CrossRef]
- 9. Yu, L.; Chen, Y.; Han, W.; Sun, X.; Li, J.; Wang, L. Preparation of porous TiO<sub>2</sub>-NTs/m-SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode for electrochemical degradation of benzoic acid. *RSC Adv.* **2016**, *6*, 19848–19856. [CrossRef]
- 10. Duan, Y.; Chen, Y.; Wen, Q.; Duan, T. Fabrication of dense spherical and rhombic Ti/Sb-SnO<sub>2</sub> electrodes with enhanced electrochemical activity by colloidal electrodeposition. *J. Electroanal. Chem.* **2016**, *768*, 81–88. [CrossRef]
- Yang, B.; Wang, J.; Jiang, C.; Li, J.; Yu, G.; Deng, S.; Lu, S.; Zhang, P.; Zhu, C.; Zhuo, Q. Electrochemical mineralization of perfluorooctane sulfonate by novel F and Sb co-doped Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub> electrode containing Sn-Sb interlayer. *Chem. Eng. J.* 2017, 316, 296–304. [CrossRef]
- 12. Yang, K.; Liu, Y.; Liu, J.; Qiao, J. Preparation optimization of multilayer-structured SnO<sub>2</sub>–Sb–Ce/Ti electrode for efficient electrocatalytic oxidation of tetracycline in water. *Chin. J. Chem. Eng.* **2018**, *26*, 2622–2627. [CrossRef]
- Yang, K.; Liu, Y.; Qiao, J. Electrodeposition preparation of Ce-doped Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrodes by using selected addition agents for efficient electrocatalytic oxidation of methylene blue in water. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* 2017, 189, 459–466. [CrossRef]
- Wu, W.; Huang, Z.-H.; Hu, Z.-T.; He, C.; Lim, T.-T. High performance duplex-structured SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb-CNT composite anode for bisphenol A removal. *Sep. Purif. Technol.* 2017, 179, 25–35. [CrossRef]
- 15. Wang, Y.; Gao, W.; He, Z.; Jin, Y.; Qiao, Y.; Cheng, G.; Gao, W.; Zhi, Z. Cu–Sn–Zn nanocomposite coatings prepared by TiO<sub>2</sub> sol-enhanced electrodeposition. *J. Appl. Electrochem.* **2020**, *50*, 875–885. [CrossRef]
- 16. He, Z.; Cao, D.; Wang, Y.; Yin, L.; Hayat, M.D.; Singh, H. Preparation of Co–P–TiO<sub>2</sub> nanocomposite coatings via a pulsed electrodeposition process. *Surf. Eng.* **2020**, *36*, 975–981. [CrossRef]
- 17. He, Z.; Cao, D.; Cao, F.; Zhang, S.; Wang, Y. Effects of heat treatment on the properties of Co–P–TiO<sub>2</sub> nanocomposite coatings. *Surf. Eng.* **2020**, *36*, 720–726. [CrossRef]
- 18. Wang, Y.X.; Cao, D.; Gao, W.D.; Qiao, Y.X.; Jin, Y.X.; Cheng, G.; Gao, W.; Zhi, Z. Microstructure and properties of sol-enhanced Co-P-TiO<sub>2</sub> nano-composite coatings. *J. Alloys Compd.* **2019**, *792*, 617–625. [CrossRef]
- Liu, Z.; Luo, X.; Ji, D. Effect of phase composition of PbO<sub>2</sub> on cycle stability of soluble lead flow batteries. J. Energy Storage 2021, 38, 102524. [CrossRef]
- 20. He, Z.; Hayat, M.D.; Huang, S.; Wang, X.; Cao, P. PbO<sub>2</sub> electrodes prepared by pulse reverse electrodeposition and their application in benzoic acid degradation. *J. Electroanal. Chem.* **2018**, *812*, 74–81. [CrossRef]
- He, Z.; Hayat, M.D.; Huang, S.; Wang, X.; Cao, P. Physicochemical characterization of PbO<sub>2</sub> coatings electrosynthesized from a methanesulfonate electrolytic solution. J. Electrochem. Soc. 2018, 165, D670–D675. [CrossRef]
- Wang, Y.X.; Hu, B.; Tay, S.L.; Hou, F.Y.; Gao, W.; Xiong, C. The microstructure and properties of sol-enhanced Sn-TiO<sub>2</sub> nanocomposite coatings. *Int. J. Mod. Phys. B* 2017, *31*, 16–19. [CrossRef]
- Sun, Y.; Cheng, S.; Mao, Z.; Lin, Z.; Ren, X.; Yu, Z. High electrochemical activity of a Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode electrodeposited using deep eutectic solvent. *Chemosphere* 2020, 239, 124715. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- He, Z.; Zhang, S.; Yin, L.; Hayat, M.D.; Cao, P. Cu–TiO<sub>2</sub> nanocomposite coatings prepared from sol-enhanced electrodeposition. *Int. J. Mod. Phys. B* 2020, 34, 2040038. [CrossRef]
- Zhang, W.; Cao, D.; Qiao, Y.; He, Z.; Wang, Y.; Li, X.; Gao, W. Microstructure and properties of duplex Ni-P-TiO<sub>2</sub>/Ni-P nanocomposite coatings. *Mater. Res.* 2019, 22. [CrossRef]
- Mao, A.; Xiang, H.-Z.; Zhang, Z.-G.; Kuramoto, K.; Yu, H.; Ran, S. Solution combustion synthesis and magnetic property of rock-salt (Co<sub>0.2</sub>Cu<sub>0.2</sub>Mg<sub>0.2</sub>Ni<sub>0.2</sub>Zn<sub>0.2</sub>) O high-entropy oxide nanocrystalline powder. *J. Magn. Magn. Mater.* 2019, 484, 245–252. [CrossRef]
- 27. Ni, Q.; Kirk, D.W.; Thorpe, S.J. Characterization of the mixed oxide layer structure of the Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> anode by photoelectron spectroscopy and impedance spectroscopy. *J. Electrochem. Soc.* **2014**, *162*, H40–H46. [CrossRef]
- 28. Patterson, A.L. The Scherrer formula for X-ray particle size determination. Phys. Rev. 1939, 56, 978–982. [CrossRef]
- 29. Allahkaram, S.R.; Nazari, M.H.; Mamaghani, S.; Zarebidaki, A. Characterization and corrosion behavior of electroless Ni–P/nano-SiC coating inside the CO<sub>2</sub> containing media in the presence of acetic acid. *Mater. Des.* **2011**, *32*, 750–755. [CrossRef]
- 30. Zhang, L.; Xu, L.; He, J.; Zhang, J. Preparation of Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrodes modified by carbon nanotube for anodic oxidation of dye wastewater and combination with nanofiltration. *Electrochim. Acta* **2014**, *117*, 192–201. [CrossRef]
- 31. Wu, T.; Zhao, G.; Lei, Y.; Li, P. Distinctive tin dioxide anode fabricated by pulse electrodeposition: High oxygen evolution potential and efficient electrochemical degradation of fluorobenzene. *J. Phys. Chem.* C **2011**, *115*, 3888–3898. [CrossRef]
- 32. Cui, Y.-H.; Feng, Y.-J.; Liu, Z.-Q. Influence of rare earths doping on the structure and electro-catalytic performance of Ti/Sb–SnO<sub>2</sub> electrodes. *Electrochim. Acta* **2009**, *54*, 4903–4909. [CrossRef]
- Duan, Y.; Wen, Q.; Chen, Y.; Duan, T.; Zhou, Y. Preparation and characterization of TiN-doped Ti/SnO<sub>2</sub>-Sb electrode by dip coating for orange II decolorization. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* 2014, 320, 746–755. [CrossRef]
- 34. Chen, Y.; Tu, Y.; Zhang, Y.H.; Lu, J.A.; Fang, B.B. Fabrication and enhanced electrocatalytic activity of TiO<sub>2</sub> nanotubes based three-dimensionally macroporous SnO<sub>2</sub> with mesoporous walls. *Chem. Eng. J.* **2017**, *311*, 100–110. [CrossRef]