



## **Is Plant Microbiota a Driver of Resistance to the Vector-Borne Pathogen** *Xylella fastidiosa*?

Alejandro Cabezas-Cruz <sup>1,\*</sup> and Apolline Maitre <sup>1,2,3,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> ANSES, INRAE, Ecole Nationale Vétérinaire d'Alfort, UMR BIPAR, Laboratoire de Santé Animale, F-94700 Maisons-Alfort, France
- <sup>2</sup> INRAE, UR 0045 Laboratoire de Recherches Sur Le Développement de L'Elevage (SELMET-LRDE), 20250 Corte, France
- <sup>3</sup> EA 7310, Laboratoire de Virologie, Université de Corse, 20250 Corte, France
- \* Correspondence: alejandro.cabezas@vet-alfort.fr (A.C.-C.); apolline.maitre@anses.fr (A.M.)

*Xylella fastidiosa* is a vector-borne plant vascular bacterial pathogen that causes several economically important diseases, including Pierce's disease (PD) in grapevine and olive quick decline syndrome (OQDS) in olive trees, among others [1]. The severity and timing of symptoms produced by X. fastidiosa differ among olive cultivars in Italy, with 'Cellina di Nardò' being one of the most severely affected cultivars, while other cultivars such as 'Leccino' exhibit milder symptoms and have been regarded as resistant [2]. Depending on the host plant, X. fastidiosa can establish non-symptomatic associations as a commensal endophyte [1,3]. In fact, in the majority of plant hosts, X. fastidiosa does not cause severe disease [4], and recent discoveries indicate that, even in its parasitic form, the bacterium displays the hallmarks of a commensal lifestyle [3]. What drives the transitions of X. fastidiosa along the 'parasite-mutualist continuum' [5]? Resistance in the 'Leccino' olive trees has been associated with the amount of lignin [6] or secondary metabolites, such as hydroxytyrosol glucoside [7], produced by this cultivar. In grapevine plants, immunity to the X. fastidiosa O-antigen was found to dictate the type of association of the bacteria with the host plant as a commensal or a parasite [3,8]. In addition, genetic factors such as gene gain/loss, recombination, genetic diversity, and linkage disequilibrium could also influence the host specificity and pathogenicity of X. fastidiosa [9,10]. However, drivers of X. fastidiosa virulence and/or plant-resistant traits are not completely understood. Are balanced plantpathogen interactions enough to explain the changes in X. fastidiosa pathogenicity across plant hosts? Can other factors such as plant microbiota counterbalance plant resistance and/or X. fastidiosa commensal lifestyles?

A recent research paper by Vergine et al. [11] attempts to answer these questions. In their study, major differences in the bacterial and fungal microbiota of X. fastidiosainfected and -uninfected olive trees of the 'Leccino' and 'Cellina di Nardò' cultivars were found [11]. Variations in microbiota composition can drive pathogen colonization resistance in animals [12] and plants [13]. Microbiota evolved complex mechanisms to reduce pathogen growth, including nutrient competition, competitive metabolic interactions, niche exclusion, and the induction of host immune response [11,13]. For example, in the flowering plant Catharanthus roseus, the endophyte Curtobacterium flaccumfaciens inhibited the growth of X. fastidiosa in vitro and reduced the symptoms caused by this bacterium to the plant host [14]. It can be challenging to identify beneficial plant-associated microbes with antagonistic activity against X. fastidiosa [15], but it is crucial to develop novel control methods against diseases caused by these bacteria [16]. In their work, Vergine et al. [11] identified some taxa found predominantly in the 'Leccino' cultivar which were proposed to be potentially involved in the resistance of cultivar to X. fastidiosa. Among them was an unidentified member of the Burkholderiaceae family. Within this bacterial family, there are some other species (e.g., Paraburkholderia phytofirmans strain PsJN) with strong activity



Citation: Cabezas-Cruz, A.; Maitre, A. Is Plant Microbiota a Driver of Resistance to the Vector-Borne Pathogen *Xylella fastidiosa? Pathogens* **2022**, *11*, 1492. https://doi.org/10.3390/ pathogens11121492

Received: 30 November 2022 Accepted: 5 December 2022 Published: 8 December 2022

**Publisher's Note:** MDPI stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:** © 2022 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/). against *X. fastidiosa* [17]. Furthermore, network analysis, a powerful tool to infer microbemicrobe interactions [18], revealed that several bacterial taxa specifically associated with 'Leccino' showed potential interactions with *X. fastidiosa* [11]. Further studies could benefit from the evidence laid by Vergine et al. [11] and further develop potential mechanisms of colonization resistance associated with the microbiota of the 'Leccino' cultivar.

Plant resistance to pathogens is usually considered from the perspective of the host plant and is highly regarded when designing strategies for pathogen control. However, mechanisms that reduce pathogen virulence can be equally relevant for the control of pathogens affecting plants. In addition to mechanisms associated with direct competition of olive microbiota against X. fastidiosa itself, the microbiota associated with 'Leccino' and 'Cellina di Nardò' cultivars may also drive changes in X. fastidiosa virulence, as invading pathogens evolve in response to host microbiota [19]. Theory shows that pathogen virulence can be influenced by within-host microbial competition [20], as microbe-microbe interactions can decrease [21] or increase [22] pathogen virulence. For example, greenhouse experiments showed that different fungal endophyte strains reduced plant infestation by the aphid *Rhopalosiphum padi*, but the endophytes had no impact on levels of barley yellow dwarf virus (BYDV), an obligate aphid-transmitted virus [23]. Interestingly, BYDV virulence was reduced in endophyte-colonized plants, suggesting that host response modulation by endophytes could reduce pathogen virulence [23]. Similarly, the inoculation of the endophytic bacterium P. phytofirmans strain PsJN triggered the expression of the grapevine *PR-1* gene and reduced plant colonization by *X. fastidiosa*, and also decreased the PD symptoms caused by the pathogen in grapevine [16]. PR-1 activation is indicative of the induction of salicylic acid (SA)-mediated host defenses [8,16]. Interestingly, X. fastidiosa infection does not trigger SA-mediated defense pathways during early phases of infection, which is associated with higher virulence in plants [8]. Thus, by inducing the expression of innate immune resistance pathways in host plants, endophytic bacteria could prime the plant immunity to an early response against X. fastidiosa, in turn reducing virulence traits [16].

Host-microbiota balance is critical for host health, and infection-induced changes can result in dysbiosis with deleterious effects for animal hosts [19,24]. Vergine et al. [11] observed dysbiosis in the X. fastidiosa-infected 'Cellina di Nardò' cultivar, while 'Leccino' maintained a similar highly diverse microbiota in both X. fastidiosa-infected and -uninfected plants. In other resistant olive cultivar, FS17, a higher alpha diversity, was linked to a lower Xylella abundance, compared to susceptible cultivars [25]. X. fastidiosa-induced dysbiosis was characterized by reduced microbial diversity in susceptible olive trees [11]. Similarly, X. fastidiosa infection was correlated with a reduction in bacterial alpha diversity measures in almond trees [26]. Differences in the endophytic grapevine microbial community were found when severely symptomatic, mildly symptomatic, or asymptomatic PD phenotypes were considered [27]. In citrus, there were significant differences in endophyte incidence between leaves and branches and among healthy citrus-variegated chlorosis (CVC)-asymptomatic and CVC-symptomatic plants [28]. Within-plant-microbial interactions are so strong that the type and strength of pairwise connections can reliably predict the outcome of pathogen invasions [13]. Knowledge of the intricacies of microbe-microbe interactions within the microbiota may help to determine the key microbial players in X. fastidiosa-plant interactions, which may inform interventions such as synthetic microbial communities with broad plant-protective activities [29] for the control of X. fastidiosa.

**Funding:** UMR BIPAR is supported by the French Government's Investissement d'Avenir program, Laboratoire d'Excellence "Integrative Biology of Emerging Infectious Diseases" (grant no. ANR-10-LABX-62-IBEID). A.M. is supported by the 'Collectivité de Corse', grant: 'Formations superieures' (SGCE-RAPPORT No. 0300).

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## References

- Rapicavoli, J.; Ingel, B.; Blanco-Ulate, B.; Cantu, D.; Roper, C. *Xylella fastidiosa*: An examination of a re-emerging plant pathogen. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* 2017, 19, 786–800. [CrossRef]
- Saponari, M.; Boscia, D.; Altamura, G.; Loconsole, G.; Zicca, S.; D'Attoma, G.; Morelli, M.; Palmisano, F.; Saponari, A.; Tavano, D.; et al. Isolation and pathogenicity of *Xylella fastidiosa* associated to the olive quick decline syndrome in southern Italy. *Sci. Rep.* 2017, 7, 17723. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 3. Roper, C.; Castro, C.; Ingel, B. *Xylella fastidiosa*: Bacterial parasitism with hallmarks of commensalism. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* **2019**, 50, 140–147. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 4. Burbank, L.P.; Roper, M.C. Microbe Profile: *Xylella fastidiosa*—A devastating agricultural pathogen with an endophytic lifestyle. *Microbiology* **2021**, *167*, 001091. [CrossRef]
- 5. Drew, G.C.; Stevens, E.J.; King, K.C. Microbial evolution and transitions along the parasite–mutualist continuum. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* **2021**, *19*, 623–638. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Sabella, E.; Luvisi, A.; Aprile, A.; Negro, C.; Vergine, M.; Nicolì, F.; Miceli, A.; De Bellis, L. *Xylella fastidiosa* induces differential expression of lignification related-genes and lignin accumulation in tolerant olive trees cv. Leccino. *J. Plant Physiol.* 2018, 220, 60–68. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Luvisi, A.; Aprile, A.; Sabella, E.; Vergine, M.; Nicolì, F.; Nutricati, E.; Miceli, A.; Negro, C.; DE Bellis, L. *Xylella fastidiosa* subsp. *pauca* (CoDiRO strain) infection in four olive (Olea europaea L.) cultivars: Profile of phenolic compounds in leaves and progression of leaf scorch symptoms. Phytopathol. Mediterr. 2017, *56*, 259–273. [CrossRef]
- Rapicavoli, J.N.; Blanco-Ulate, B.; Muszyński, A.; Figueroa-Balderas, R.; Morales-Cruz, A.; Azadi, P.; Dobruchowska, J.M.; Castro, C.; Cantu, D.; Roper, M.C. Lipopolysaccharide O-antigen delays plant innate immune recognition of *Xylella fastidiosa*. *Nat. Commun.* 2018, *9*, 390. [CrossRef]
- 9. Vanhove, M.; Retchless, A.C.; Sicard, A.; Rieux, A.; Coletta-Filho, H.D.; De La Fuente, L.; Stenger, D.C.; Almeida, R.P.P. Genomic Diversity and Recombination among *Xylella fastidiosa* Subspecies. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **2019**, *85*, e02972-18. [CrossRef]
- 10. Castillo, A.I.; Chacón-Díaz, C.; Rodríguez-Murillo, N.; Coletta-Filho, H.D.; Almeida, R.P.P. Impacts of local population history and ecology on the evolution of a globally dispersed pathogen. *BMC Genom.* **2020**, *21*, 369. [CrossRef]
- 11. Vergine, M.; Meyer, J.B.; Cardinale, M.; Sabella, E.; Hartmann, M.; Cherubini, P.; De Bellis, L.; Luvisi, A. The *Xylella fastidiosa*-Resistant Olive Cultivar "Leccino" Has Stable Endophytic Microbiota during the Olive Quick Decline Syndrome (OQDS). *Pathogens* **2019**, *9*, 35. [CrossRef]
- 12. Sassone-Corsi, M.; Raffatellu, M. No vacancy: How beneficial microbes cooperate with immunity to provide colonization resistance to pathogens. *J. Immunol.* **2015**, *194*, 4081–4087. [CrossRef]
- 13. Li, M.; Wei, Z.; Wang, J.; Jousset, A.; Friman, V.; Xu, Y.; Shen, Q.; Pommier, T. Facilitation promotes invasions in plant-associated microbial communities. *Ecol. Lett.* **2018**, *22*, 149–158. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 14. Lacava, P.T.; Li, W.; Araújo, W.L.; Azevedo, J.; Hartung, J.S. The endophyte Curtobacterium flaccumfaciens reduces symptoms caused by *Xylella fastidiosa* in Catharanthus roseus. *J. Microbiol.* **2007**, *45*, 388–393. [PubMed]
- 15. Zicca, S.; De Bellis, P.; Masiello, M.; Saponari, M.; Saldarelli, P.; Boscia, D.; Sisto, A. Antagonistic activity of olive endophytic bacteria and of *Bacillus* spp. strains against *Xylella fastidiosa*. *Microbiol. Res.* **2020**, *236*, 126467. [CrossRef]
- Baccari, C.; Antonova, E.; Lindow, S. Biological Control of Pierce's Disease of Grape by an Endophytic Bacterium. *Phytopathology* 2019, 109, 248–256. [CrossRef]
- Sessitsch, A.; Coenye, T.; Sturz, A.V.; Vandamme, P.; Barka, E.A.; Salles, J.F.; Van Elsas, J.D.; Faure, D.; Reiter, B.; Glick, B.R.; et al. Burkholderia phytofirmans sp. nov., a novel plant-associated bacterium with plant-beneficial properties. *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 2005, 55 Pt 3, 1187–1192. [CrossRef]
- 18. Röttjers, L.; Faust, K. From hairballs to hypotheses–biological insights from microbial networks. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.* **2018**, 42, 761–780. [CrossRef]
- Stevens, E.J.; Bates, K.A.; King, K.C. Host microbiota can facilitate pathogen infection. PLOS Pathog. 2021, 17, e1009514. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Brown, S.P.; Inglis, R.F.; Taddei, F. SYNTHESIS: Evolutionary ecology of microbial wars: Within-host competition and (incidental) virulence. *Evol. Appl.* 2009, 2, 32–39. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 21. Massey, R.C.; Buckling, A.; Ffrench-Constant, R. Interference competition and parasite virulence. *Proc. R. Soc. B Boil. Sci.* 2004, 271, 785–788. [CrossRef]
- Barreto, H.C.; Sousa, A.; Gordo, I. The Landscape of Adaptive Evolution of a Gut Commensal Bacteria in Aging Mice. *Curr. Biol.* 2020, 30, 1102–1109.e5. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 23. Rúa, M.A.; McCulley, R.L.; Mitchell, C.E. Fungal endophyte infection and host genetic background jointly modulate host response to an aphid-transmitted viral pathogen. *J. Ecol.* **2013**, *101*, 1007–1018. [CrossRef]
- 24. Gopal, M.; Gupta, A.; Thomas, G.V. Bespoke microbiome therapy to manage plant diseases. *Front. Microbiol.* **2013**, *4*, 355. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Giampetruzzi, A.; Baptista, P.; Morelli, M.; Cameirão, C.; Neto, T.L.; Costa, D.; D'Attoma, G.; Kubaa, R.A.; Altamura, G.; Saponari, M.; et al. Differences in the Endophytic Microbiome of Olive Cultivars Infected by *Xylella Fastidiosa* across Seasons. *Pathogens* 2020, *9*, 723. [CrossRef]

- Anguita-Maeso, M.; Ares-Yebra, A.; Haro, C.; Román-Écija, M.; Olivares-García, C.; Costa, J.; Marco-Noales, E.; Ferrer, A.; Navas-Cortés, J.A.; Landa, B.B. *Xylella fastidiosa* Infection Reshapes Microbial Composition and Network Associations in the Xylem of Almond Trees. *Front. Microbiol.* 2022, 13, 866085. [CrossRef]
- 27. Deyett, E.; Roper, M.C.; Ruegger, P.; Yang, J.-I.; Borneman, J.; Rolshausen, P.E. Microbial Landscape of the Grapevine Endosphere in the Context of Pierce's Disease. *Phytobiomes J.* 2017, *1*, 138–149. [CrossRef]
- Lacava, P.; Araujo, W.; Marcon, J.; Maccheroni, W.; Azevedo, J. Interaction between endophytic bacteria from citrus plants and the phytopathogenic bacteria *Xylella fastidiosa*, causal agent of citrus-variegated chlorosis. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol.* 2004, 39, 55–59. [CrossRef]
- 29. Vannier, N.; Agler, M.; Hacquard, S. Microbiota-mediated disease resistance in plants. PLoS Pathog. 2019, 15, e1007740. [CrossRef]