

*Peer-Review Record:*

## **Looked at Life from Both Sides Now**

**Jillian E. Smith, Allisandra K. Mowles, Anil K. Mehta and David G. Lynn**

***Life* 2014, 4, 887-902, doi:10.3390/life4040887**

*Reviewer 1:* Anonymous

*Reviewer 2:* Leslie S. Smith

*Editor:* Niles Lehman (Guest Editor of Special Issue “The Origins and Early Evolution of RNA”)

*Received:* 12 October 2014

*First Revision Received:* 1 December 2014

*Accepted:* 2 December 2014

*Published:* 11 December 2014

---

### **First Round of Evaluation**

#### *Round 1: Reviewer 1 Report and Author Response*

Here, we have an excellent review that perfectly fits into the Special Issue, “The Origins and Early Evolution of RNA,” in the journal, *Life*. I had found this article very thorough and it contains a very appropriate selection of bibliographical references that shed light on the several points related to protein/nucleic acid biopolymer mutualism; these points are described in the main text. I did not find major written errors in the main text. I only found that the figure 1 caption text hypens (-) should be included in “beta stands” and in the “beta sheets” pairs in Lines 2 and 3, respectively. Also, the author must check all journal names abbreviations in the References and Notes section. For instance in:

- #23 Journal of Insect Physiology should be J. Insect Physiol.;
- #28 and #39 Nature reviews. Genetics should be Nature Rev. Genet.;
- #34 Nucleic Acids Research should be Nucleic Acids Res.;
- #40 Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B should be Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B;
- #43 Organic & Biomolecular Chemistry should be Org. Biomol. Chem.; and some more journal names that are not abbreviated.

Greetings.

*Response: These mistakes were found by the reviewer and corrected.*

- #23 *Journal of Insect Physiology* should be *J. Insect Physiol.*;
- #28 and #39 *Nature reviews. Genetics* should be *Nature Rev. Genet.*;
- #34 *Nucleic Acids Research* should be *Nucleic Acids Res.*;
- #40 *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B* should be *Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B*;
- #43 *Organic & Biomolecular Chemistry* should be *Org. Biomol. Chem.*

*I also updated the following journal to the ISO guidelines:*

- *Proceedings of the National Academies of Science* to *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*
- *Accounts of Chemical Research* to *Accounts Chem. Res.*
- *Current Protein and Peptide Science* to *Curr. Protein Pept. Sci.*
- *Chemical Society Reviews* to *Chem. Soc. Rev.*
- *Cold Spring Harbor Perspectives in Biology* to *Cold Spring Harb. Perspect. Biol.*
- *Journal of the American Chemical Society* to *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*
- *Journal of Material Chemistry C* to *J. Mater. Chem. C*
- *Origins of Life and Evolution of the Biosphere* to *Orig. Life Evol. Biosph.*
- *Acta Astronautica* to *Acta Astronaut.*

*Information to cite #88*

*Journal: Comptes Rendus des Seances de la Societe de Biologie et de ses Filiales (French)*

*Title: The optic properties of amyloid*

*Year: 1927*

*Authors: Divry, P., Florkin, M.*

#### *Round 1: Reviewer 2 Report and Author Response*

This is a review, discussing the area of what makes living systems. This is of growing interest, specifically from the computation side (which I know about), and from the chemistry side (which I do not know about). It is a useful review, building on many papers, but in particular, the work of Root-Bernstein, and earlier papers (with some of the authors in common with this) on Goodwin *et al.* 2012. It is well written, and I can more or less understand it, but I lack the detailed chemistry/biochemistry vocabulary to really get a grip on this paper.

The second half of the last paragraph sums up really well where this work is heading: and that's surely of interest to readers of a journal called "Life"!

*Response: Thanks.*

© 2014 by the reviewers; licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).