

Review

# WO<sub>3</sub>–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> Active Oxides for NO<sub>x</sub> SCR by NH<sub>3</sub>: Preparation Methods, Catalysts' Composition, and Deactivation Mechanism—A Review

# Weidong Zhang <sup>1,2</sup>, Shuhua Qi<sup>2</sup>, Giuseppe Pantaleo <sup>1,\*</sup> and Leonarda Francesca Liotta <sup>1,\*</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Institute for the Study of Nanostructured Materials-Council National Research (ISMN-CNR), 90146 Palermo, Italy; weidzhang1208@126.com
- <sup>2</sup> Department of Applied Chemistry, School of Natural and Applied Sciences, Northwestern Polytechnical University, Xi'an 710072, China; qishuhuanwpu@163.com
- \* Correspondence: giuseppe-pantaleo@cnr.it (G.P.); leonardafrancesca.liotta@cnr.it (L.F.L.); Tel.: +39-091-6809-251(G.P.); +39-091-6809-371(L.F.L.)

Received: 19 April 2019; Accepted: 4 June 2019; Published: 13 June 2019



**Abstract:** Researchers in the field of the selective catalytic reduction (SCR) of nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>x</sub>: NO, NO<sub>2</sub>, or N<sub>2</sub>O) by NH<sub>3</sub> are still greatly challenging the optimization of low-temperature activity and selectivity, high-temperature stability, resistance to alkali metals and other poisoning agents, such as Hg, As, etc. The present study reviews the research progress, related to the latest 20 years, on WO<sub>3</sub>–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-based catalysts that are expected to overcome the catalytic performances of the current SCR catalytic devices. In details, the effects of the synthesis methods, chemical composition, type of supports (metal oxides, molecular sieves, and filters), doping elements, or metal oxides added as promoters of WO<sub>3</sub>–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-based catalysts and, finally, the influence of SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O in the reaction mixture are addressed. The importance of understanding the deactivation mechanism in the presence of several poisoning agents is also emphasized, which should be taken into consideration for the design of new catalysts.

**Keywords:** selective catalytic reduction; WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-based catalysts; low-temperature activity and selectivity; deactivation mechanism

# 1. Introduction

# 1.1. NO<sub>x</sub> Problem, Control Regulations, and Removal Technologies

Agriculture, industries, power generation plants, and transportation are the major sources responsible of air pollution [1]: Ozone depletion, eutrophication, smog, global warming, and acid rain have attracted wide attention from human beings [2,3]. In order to reduce air pollution, new regulations have been introduced in the latest years, such as the Directive 2010/75/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council concerning industrial activities, European standards for vehicles' exhaust gas emissions in Europe, as well as EPA (Environmental Protection Agency) tier regulations in the USA and analogous emission standards developed by the Japanese government.

Naval diesel engines use heavy fuel oil with a high sulfur content, thus most of the pollutants are nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>x</sub>), particulate matter (PM), and sulfur oxides (SO<sub>x</sub>) [4]. To limit NO<sub>x</sub> emissions, strict regulations and legislations have been set up by the international maritime organization (IMO) that came into force on 1 January 2016 (MARPOL Annex VI) and will be tighter in the future [5].

Many techniques have been applied for the abatement of  $NO_x$  emissions, such as pre-combustion and combustion modifications [6,7], as well tail-end control equipment [2,8]. Tail-end control devices are the most efficient in the removal of  $NO_x$ , including selective noncatalytic reduction



One of the last key reviews addressing the chemical and mechanistic aspects of the selective catalytic reduction of NOx by ammonia over oxide catalysts was published in 1998 by Busca et al. [14]. The authors reviewed the performances of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ – $MoO_3$  catalysts and compared with catalysts containing Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, CuO, MnO<sub>x</sub>, and CrO<sub>x</sub> with special attention given to spectroscopic studies, adsorption–desorption measurements, and kinetic experiments. However, the reaction mechanism was not unanimously recognized and some disagreement points were underlined. Since then, the number of articles dealing with NO SCR by NH<sub>3</sub> over WO<sub>3</sub>–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> basic catalysts has undergone dramatic growth. Moreover, in the last 20 years, new restrictive limits to NOx emissions have been introduced by world regulations. Therefore, we consider that is worthwhile to summarize here the most recent results on WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> active oxides, paying attention to the chemical effects (preparation methods, catalysts' composition, promoting effects, and deactivation mechanism) that are still a matter of debate in the literature.

# 1.2. SCR Application for After-Treatment of Fossil Fueled Engines in Transportation

For transportation,  $NO_x$  emissions originate from vehicles' and ships' engines. The automotive industry, especially for heavy-duty truck and bus engines, has adopted urea-SCR (Selective Catalytic Reduction) to reach the  $NO_x$  limits required by regulations to meet the Euro V (2008) and the JP 2005  $NO_x$  limits. The first commercial diesel truck applications were launched in November 2004 by Nissan Diesel in Japan and in early 2005 by Daimler in Europe [15]. In light-duty vehicles, the SCR was introduced in some US EPA tier 2 vehicles. By 2012 to 2015, most of the tier 2 vehicles with NOx adsorbers had been converted to urea-SCR. In Europe, the SCR was introduced on certain Euro 5 models, with a much wider application of the technology in Euro 6 vehicles to meet the US Tier 4i/EU Stage IIIB emission standards.

For marine SCR applications, the main challenges are sulfur resistance and activation at low temperatures [16]. The latter is also a challenge for cars, trucks, and non-road applications and may imply that the catalyst remains inactive during start-up and maneuvering [17]. Nowadays, one of the most investigated catalysts for NH<sub>3</sub>–SCR is V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub> (MoO<sub>3</sub>)/TiO<sub>2</sub>, which can meet the requirement at temperatures in range ~300–400 °C [18]. At temperatures as low as 100–150 °C, no effective catalytic after-treatment of exhaust gases occurs. For that reason, the SCR catalyst should be placed upstream of the turbocharger, as close to the engine as possible to allow high temperatures for high NO<sub>x</sub> conversion and to avoid the formation of ammonium sulfates. In fact, on the one hand, the SCR unit is located downstream of the electrostatic precipitator and desulfurizer to avoid the catalyst deactivation caused by ash and SO<sub>2</sub> poisoning [19,20]. On the other hand, the high pressure increases the catalytic reaction but also enhances the undesired side reactions. Based on the above considerations, an exploitation and investigation of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts with low-temperature activity and high-temperature stability as well as resistance to Hg, alkali metals, is still a great challenge for practical applications.

Over the last 20 years, to overcome the deficiency, many kinds of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ -based catalysts have been prepared with different methods, supports, chemical compositions, and doping agents. Therefore, in this article, we overview the recent progresses in catalytic  $NO_x$  SCR by  $NH_3$ , especially focusing on  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ -based catalysts.

## 2. WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-Based SCR Catalysts

#### 2.1. Reasons for the Use of WO<sub>3</sub>–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-Based Catalysts

To date,  $WO_3-V_2O_5/TiO_2$  catalysts are the most effective systems for practical applications and are widely used for NO SCR with NH<sub>3</sub>. Therefore, the effect of WO<sub>3</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> on the catalytic performance must be understood for further research in this area.

According to the investigation of Zhang et al. [21], WO<sub>3</sub> play an important role in catalyzing NO SCR with NH<sub>3</sub>, due to the following promotional effects of WO<sub>3</sub>: (i) Increases the amounts of Lewis acidic sites; (ii) inhibits the sintering of anatase TiO<sub>2</sub>; and (iii) WO<sub>3</sub> can be easily reduced to W<sup>5+</sup> and the standard reduction potential of W<sup>6+</sup> to W<sup>5+</sup> is only -0.03 eV. Thus, the reduced W<sup>5+</sup> species can be oxidized by oxygen, meanwhile, oxygen may be reduced to superoxide ions. In the case of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, (i) the surface acidity (Brønsted and Lewis) can be improved by adding V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>; and (ii) there is a direct correlation between high surface V<sup>3+</sup> + V<sup>4+</sup>/V<sup>n+</sup> and the V<sup>4+</sup>/V<sup>5+</sup> ratio and the SCR activity. Furthermore, the behavior of the oxygen species bonded to the vanadium and the dispersion of the active species are influenced by the support. Well-dispersed and isolated vanadium oxide species show low activity for the SCR reaction but present a high selectivity towards N<sub>2</sub>.

More importantly, it has been reported that the interaction between WO<sub>3</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> enhances the catalytic performance [22]: (i) V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> increases Brønsted and Lewis acid sites, while WO<sub>3</sub> promotes Lewis acid sites. Both types of acid sites promote the NO SCR—the Brønsted acidity favors the conversion at low temperatures, up to 300 °C, while Lewis acid sites are the active sites above 300 °C; (ii) by increasing the amount of reduced V<sup>4+</sup> species, the NO conversion also increases. The effects of the supporting WO<sub>3</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, active oxides, over titania have been also addressed by the authors [21], who investigated V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>, V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>, and WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-nanotube model catalysts for NO SCR with NH<sub>3</sub>. The addition of WO<sub>3</sub> between 3 and 6 wt % in the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts increased the reduced V<sup>4+</sup> species on the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. However, it has been reported that above 6 wt % of WO<sub>3</sub>, the reduced V<sup>4+</sup> species remain constant on the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts; and (iii) tetrahedral monovanadate and polymeric surface vanadate also coexist in V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts.

Finally, the effects of SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O on the catalytic activity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts were also evaluated by the same authors [22]. They found that the NO conversion is not affected by SO<sub>2</sub> but water inhibits the catalytic activity. The influence of SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O in the reaction stream, strongly depending on the catalyst composition and reaction conditions, will be addressed in more detail later in the manuscript.

The changes occurring on  $WO_3$  and  $V_2O_5$  after supporting over  $TiO_2$  must be highly evaluated. The relation between tungsten and vanadium oxide species in  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts was widely investigated for two series of catalysts containing 0.5 to 5 wt % V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> and 0 or 10 wt % WO<sub>3</sub> impregnated onto a high surface-area titania hydrate with an anatase structure [23]. The above-mentioned loadings were chosen in order to keep the theoretical coverages of the transition metal oxides on the surface equal or less than 1. It has been reported that the interaction of  $TiO_2$  with supported V(V) or W(VI) oxide species can strongly affect the structure of the surface oxide phases formed which strongly differ from the corresponding bulk oxides. For instance, isolated surface oxide species having strongly distorted tetrahedral geometry were formed in the case of vanadium at low V oxide coverage, in dehydrated samples. At higher loadings, oligomeric or polymeric metavanadate species forming two-dimensional islands along with  $V_2O_5$  nanoparticles were observed. It is not clear if aggregates or oxide crystals are formed for V2O5 contents below the theoretical monolayer, however, it was clearly demonstrated that well-prepared catalysts form two-dimensional surface oxides until the support is completely covered, then the surface oxide species grow into the third dimension. In the case of dehydrated  $WO_3/TiO_2$ catalysts, formation of strongly distorted octahedral surface species  $((-O)_5 - W = O)$  occurs up to high tungsten oxide coverage [23].

# 2.2. Effect of Preparation Method on Activity and Selectivity

According to the literature, impregnation (wet, dry, and incipient wetness) [24–27], co-precipitation [26], deposition–precipitation [28], sol–gel [29], and grafting [30] are the main synthesis methods to prepare  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>-based SCR catalysts and all of them are summarized in Table 1.

Catalysts	Syntheses Method (Cal. Tem./°C)	The Key Facts to the Activity	Ref.
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Wet impregnation (450 °C)	Compared with dry-impregnated catalyst, wet-impregnated catalyst increases the	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Dry impregnation (450 °C)	intensity of Brønsted acid sites and the oxidation of the $ab-NH_3$ .	[=+]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Wet impregnation (500 °C)	By increasing the precursor solution acidity, more polymeric vanadium species are formed on the catalyst surface; the ratio of $V^{4+(3+)}/V^{5+}$ , surface acidity, and quantity of active sites are increased, whereas the activity of the catalyst is largely improved.	[25]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Co-precipitation (500 °C)	The enhanced performance of co-precipitated compared to the impregnated catalysts was associated with the co-precipitated $V_2O_5$ -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> catalysts possess new surface: O = WO <sub>4</sub> (enhanced the adsorption of NH <sub>3</sub> ) and redox surface	[26]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Incipient wetness impregnation (500 °C)	mono-oxo O = VO <sub>3</sub> sites, because of the surface defects of the $TiO_2$ .	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Oxalic acid leaching and impregnation (600 $^\circ$ C)	Oxalic acid leaching is an effective way to reduce the impurities and increase reducibility of the recovered catalyst.	[27]
Ce-V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Deposition-precipitation (500 °C)	The higher NO <sub>x</sub> conversion at low temperature has origin from surface Ce species	[28]
Ce-V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Impregnation method (500 °C)	and can be assigned to more active Lewis acid sites, the weakly adsorbed $NO_2$ and monodentate nitrate.	[=0]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Sol-gel method (400-800 °C)	Well dispersed and isolated vanadium oxide species were found to be weakly active for the SCR reaction but with a high selectivity to $N_2$ .	[29]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	Grafting (300 °C)	Grafting mode and metal oxides loadings were significantly affecting the strength of interaction of $V_2O_5$ and $WO_3$ .	[30]

Table 1.	Summary	of the synt	hesis method	Is of $V_2O_5$ -V	VO <sub>3</sub> -based SCR of	catalysts.

As shown in Figure 1, Yu et al. [24] investigated the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activities of  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts as fresh and poisoned by potassium chloride, prepared by wet and dry impregnation methods. They found that the wet-impregnated sample, WWT(W), shows a slightly higher activity than the impregnated one (D) at around 200 °C and this was ascribed to the formation of agglomerated V species which increases the intensity of Brønsted acid sites and the oxidation of adsorbed NH<sub>3</sub>, while isolated V species were predominant on the dry-impregnated catalyst. After the addition of KCl, both catalysts deactivated due to the decreasing amount of ammonium ions coordinated on the Brønsted acid sites. Isolated vanadia species (DK) appeared to be more reactive with potassium and therefore more severely deactivated.



**Figure 1.** NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR (Selective Catalytic Reduction) activities of the fresh and poisoned (by KCl)  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts prepared by wet and dry impregnation methods and denoted as VWT ( $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>) (W), VWT (D), VWT (WK), and VWT (DK), respectively. (Reprinted with permission from [24]. Copyright (2013) Elsevier).

Dong et al. [25] optimized the preparation conditions (wet impregnation) by focusing on the effect of the pH value of the vanadium precursor solution on the catalytic performance of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> in low temperature NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO<sub>x</sub>. According to XPS (X-Ray Photoelectron Spectroscopy), Raman, H<sub>2</sub>-TPR (Temperature Programmed Reduction), NH<sub>3</sub>-TPD (Temperature Programmed Desorption), and NH<sub>3</sub>-DRIFT (Diffuse Reflectance Infrared Fourier Transform Spectroscopy) characterizations, it resulted that the outstanding activity of the catalyst with the decreased pH value could be responsible for the following: More polymeric vanadium species were formed on the catalyst surface; meanwhile, the ratio of V<sup>4+(3+)</sup>/V<sup>5+</sup>, surface acidity, and quantity of active sites were increased. Thus, it should be considered that an enhancement of the precursor solution acidity is an effective way to improve SCR catalysts' activity.

The influence of the catalyst synthesis method on the SCR of NO by NH<sub>3</sub> over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts was also investigated by He et al. [26]. In this article, they prepared the catalysts by two different synthesis methods: Co-precipitation of aqueous vanadium and tungsten oxide precursors with TiO(OH)<sub>2</sub> and incipient wetness impregnation of the aqueous precursors on a crystalline TiO<sub>2</sub> support. The composition difference of the two types of catalysts was confirmed by XRD (X-Ray Diffraction) and HS-LEIS (High Sensitivity-Low Energy Ion Scattering Spectroscopy) and a distinction of their activity was also revealed by in situ Raman and IR (Infrared) spectroscopy. Co-precipitated catalysts contain oligomerized surface mono-oxo  $O = VO_3$  and  $O = WO_4$  sites on the TiO<sub>2</sub> support. The enhanced performance of co-precipitated catalysts compared to the impregnated ones was associated with the

formation of new  $O = WO_4$  species, able to adsorb NH<sub>3</sub>, and to the presence of redox surface mono-oxo  $O = VO_3$  sites.

Qi et al. [27] reported the synthesis of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts from waste commercial SCR catalysts through oxalic acid leaching and impregnation with different  $V_2O_5$  loadings (0.5%, 1.0%, and 1.5 wt %). The NO conversion of the newly synthesized catalyst with 1.0%  $V_2O_5$  almost recovered the activity of the fresh catalyst (91% of the NO conversion at 300 °C) and showed good resistance to SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O.

Meiqing et al. [28] systematically investigated Ce-modified  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> (V/WTi) catalysts by the deposition–precipitation method (V/Ce/WTi-DP and Ce/WTi-DP) and the conventional impregnation method (V/Ce/WTi-IMP and Ce/WTi-IMP). As shown in Figure 2, the results revealed that the activity was mainly dependent on the status of Ce, which not only possessed more surface Ce species but also presented a higher reducibility of the Ce species. The higher NO<sub>x</sub> conversion can be assigned to more active Lewis acid sites, the weakly adsorbed NO<sub>2</sub>, and the monodentate nitrate.



**Figure 2.**  $NH_3$ -SCR performance over various catalysts as a function of temperature (**a**), (**c**), (**d**)  $NO_x$  conversion; (**b**)  $N_2O$  concentration. (Reprinted with permission from [28]. Copyright (2016) Elsevier).

Djerad et al. [29] prepared  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts by the sol–gel method with different W and V loadings and calcined at different temperatures. The results are shown in Figure 3, in which it is shown that the  $V_2O_5$  content strongly influences the catalytic behavior: Weakly active for the SCR reaction but with a high selectivity to N<sub>2</sub>. Moreover, the NO<sub>x</sub> conversion and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity achieved up to 100% in the temperature range of 250 to 325 °C. Meanwhile, 3 wt % V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–9 wt % WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> was the best catalyst not only for the NO<sub>x</sub> conversion, but also for the N<sub>2</sub> selectivity.



**Figure 3.** NO<sub>x</sub> conversion (**a**) and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity (**b**) vs. temperature over 3 wt.%V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–9 wt.% WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and 8 wt % V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–9 wt.% WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. (Reprinted with permission from [29]. Copyright (2004) Elsevier).

Reiche et al. [30] explored the influence of the grafting sequence and simultaneous grafting of  $V_2O_5$  and  $WO_3$  on the properties of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. DRIFT and XPS indicated that V and W species do not exist independently on the TiO<sub>2</sub> surface. More importantly,  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts synthesized by sequential grafting do not result in a hierarchical structure. However, changing the grafting mode and metal oxides loadings significantly affected the strength of interaction of  $V_2O_5$  and  $WO_3$ .

In Table 1 and from the above-mentioned research, we cannot directly affirm which was the best method to synthesize catalysts with high activity and selectivity in a broad temperature window. New methods able to improve the specific surface area and to increase the active sites of catalysts should be considered in the design of new catalysts. In addition, the activity and selectivity are significantly affected by the active metal oxides loading.

### 2.3. Effect of the Support on Catalytic Activity

To enhance the stability and the activity,  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>-based multiple metal oxides and supported catalysts have been widely studied. They can be classified into two types: Metal oxides and molecular sieves or filters as carriers.

## 2.3.1. Metal Oxides as Carriers

 $V_2O_5-WO_3/TiO_2$  is a classical commercial catalyst that has been widely investigated for NO SCR. It has been reported that only the TiO<sub>2</sub> anatase phase has no activity for NO SCR with NH<sub>3</sub> [31]. However, it is well known that TiO<sub>2</sub> anatase improves the catalytic activity by dispersing the  $V_2O_5-WO_3$  active phases [32]. At high temperatures, >700 °C, transition from the anatase to rutile phase occurs and such process is strongly influenced by the oxygen vacancies' concentration [21]. As will be discussed in the following Section 2.4, the presence of oxygen vacancies in the support helps the formation of  $W^{5+}$  species able to active superoxide ions.

Reiche et al. [30,33] prepared  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> by simultaneous grafting of TiO<sub>2</sub> with  $V_2O_5$  and WO<sub>3</sub>. According to the DRIFT, XPS, and TOF-SIMS (Time-of-Flight secondary ion mass spectrometry) investigations, indicating V and W species do not exist independently on the titania surface (V-O-W connectivity were present on the  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts), which results in a higher activity compared to the corresponding titania-supported single oxides. The studies demonstrate that the activity could be enhanced by grafting  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub> on TiO<sub>2</sub>.

Zhang et al. [34] elucidated the interaction of V, W, and Ti species on the surface of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts for the improvement of the catalytic activity. XRD, UV-vis, PL spectra, DFT theoretical calculations, and in situ DRIFT showed that WO<sub>3</sub> could interact with TiO<sub>2</sub> to improve the electrons transfer due to the V-O-W species, in agreement with Reiche et al. [30,33]. Moreover, the XPS and EPR observations confirmed the presence V<sup>4+</sup> species, which are the active sites for the superoxide ion formation. Such species promoted NO oxidation to NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and improved the decomposition of NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> to NO<sub>2</sub>, facilitating the reaction rate of "fast SCR".

Kompio et al. [23] highlighted a new point on the relations between tungsten and vanadium, studying two series of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO\_2 catalysts with different  $V_2O_5$  contents (0.5–5 wt %) and 0 or 10 wt % WO\_3 impregnated over titania hydrate with an anatase structure. The catalysts were investigated by XRD, specific surface area measurements, Raman and EPR (Electron Paramagnetic Resonance) spectroscopy, temperature-programmed reduction (TPR), and SCR. It was concluded that tungsten plays a promotional effect on the neighboring vanadium oxide species, favoring their dispersion.

The positive role of W was confirmed also by Zhang et al. [35] and Wang et al. [36], who found that WO<sub>3</sub> species play an important role in the formation of superoxide ions ( $O_2^-$ ) over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO. This was due to an improved electron transfer between the V-O-W species, which facilitates the formation of reduced  $V_2O_5$  (V<sup>4+</sup> and V<sup>3+</sup>). The best activity was registered with a WO3 loading of 6 wt %. However, it should be noticed that WO3 was an electron withdrawal, so higher WO3 loadings might trap electrons to inhibit the formation of superoxide ions.

Zhang et al. [37] investigated the promotional roles of  $ZrO_2$  and  $WO_3$  over  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3/TiO_2$ - $ZrO_2$  SCR catalysts. They found that  $ZrO_2$  improved the thermally stability, while  $WO_3$  increased the Brønsted acid sites of the catalysts. Furthermore, a combination of  $WO_3$  and  $ZrO_2$  enhanced the dispersion of all metal oxides. As shown in Figure 4, the highest  $NO_x$  conversion was achieved over  $V_2O_5$ -9wt.%  $WO_3/TiO_2$ - $ZrO_2$  and this finding partially results from the  $ZrO_2$  doping that considerably increased the BET surface area and favored the dispersion of the active components on the surface. However, the mainly promotional role was to change the pathway of  $NO_x$  reduction and the surface acidity of  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3/TiO_2$ . There are only Lewis acid sites on the  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3$  supported over  $TiO_2$ - $ZrO_2$ , while Brønsted and Lewis acid sites coexisted on  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3/TiO_2$ .



**Figure 4.**  $NO_x$  conversions over different catalysts with (**a**) and without (**b**)  $O_2$ . (Reprinted with permission from [37]. Copyright (2016) Elsevier).

Herrmann et al. [38] prepared a  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst by supporting the  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3$  over TiO<sub>2</sub> EUROCAT and investigated the electrical properties under different atmospheres, such as pure oxygen, NO, and NH<sub>3</sub> with and without O<sub>2</sub>. In the absence of oxygen, NO has an electron acceptor character (as NO<sup>-</sup>) that is able to fill the anionic vacancies, which are mostly present on  $V_2O_5$ . On the other hand, NH<sub>3</sub> had a strong reduction behavior with the formation of ionized vacancies. In the presence of oxygen, the anionic vacancies of the catalysts were filled by oxygen, therefore, the NO did

not exhibit its electron acceptor character anymore, reacting directly with  $NH_3$ , bounded on the acid sites. Under the  $NO + NH_3$  mixture, without oxygen, an increased electrical conductivity was found, ascribed to the formation of anionic vacancies, especially over vanadia, due to dihydroxylation and dehydration of the surface.

Jung et al. [39] supported  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub> on TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> and characterized the catalysts by BET, XRD, XPS, TPD, and H<sub>2</sub>-TPR analyses. Compared with the  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, in the  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, the sulfate deposited over titania did not affect the physical properties (in terms of the BET surface area and phase transformation). Conversely, in TPD and H<sub>2</sub>-TPR, it was found that the sulfate stability strongly depended on the loaded metal oxides. In addition, the reduction property of  $V_2O_5$  also changed due to the interaction between the V-O-W species. In Figure 5, the SCR activity in terms of the NO conversion over TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>,  $V_2O_5$ /TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, and  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>, is compared.



**Figure 5.** SCR activity: (a)  $TiO_2$ - $SO_4^{2-}$ , (b)  $V_2O_5/TiO_2$ - $SO_4^{2-}$ , (c)  $WO_3/TiO_2$ - $SO_4^{2-}$ , and (d)  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3/TiO_2$ - $SO_4^{2-}$  (Reprinted with permission from [39]. Copyright (2001) Elsevier).

The similar activity between  $V_2O_5/TiO_2-SO_4^{2-}$  and  $V_2O_5-WO_3/TiO_2-SO_4^{2-}$  at low temperatures was explained by focusing on the dispersion between acid and redox sites. At high temperatures, the redox property modified by the V-O-W species contributed to the high activity.

Sun et al. [40] prepared a V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/Ti<sub>0.5</sub>Sn<sub>0.5</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (TS) SCR catalyst by supporting V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub> on Ti<sub>0.5</sub>Sn<sub>0.5</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. The results revealed that the activity of the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR reaction was closely correlated to the Brønsted acid sites, and they were in direct proportion with the amount of WO<sub>3</sub> up to the highly-dispersed particles formed. Indeed, when the WO<sub>3</sub> exist in a dispersed state, the tungsten atoms are adjacent to the vanadium atoms forming the V-O-W bonds that are responsible for the increased Brønsted acidity. However, further increases of WO<sub>3</sub> (loadings  $\geq$  1.0 mmol/100 m<sup>2</sup> TS) results in the formation of crystalline WO<sub>3</sub> that covers the active sites, leading to a decrease of the activities.

Camposeco et al. [41] synthesized a series of titanic acid nanotubes (TANs) by the conventional hydrothermal method. Then,  $V_2O_5/WO_3$  was added by wet impregnation. The catalytic activity of the  $V_2O_5$  (5 wt %)– $WO_3$  (3 wt %)/TAN catalysts was strongly improved for the SCR-NH<sub>3</sub> process in a wide range of temperatures in comparison with both samples,  $V_2O_5$  (10 wt %)/TAN and  $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3/TiO_2$  (see Figure 6a). Interestingly, the above mentioned  $V_2O_5$  (5 wt %)– $WO_3$  (3 wt %)/TAN catalyst showed better NO conversion values than  $V_2O_5$  (10 wt %)/TAN in the presence of water (10 vol %) and  $SO_2$ 



**Figure 6.** (a) NO conversions over different catalysts; (c) NO and NH<sub>3</sub> conversions over 5 wt  $V_2O_5$ -5 wt  $V_0O_3$ /TAN catalyst; NO conversions in the presents of H<sub>2</sub>O and SO<sub>2</sub> (**b**,**d**) over the above mentioned catalysts. (Figure 6a,b reprinted with permission from [41]. Copyright (2014) Elsevier. Figure 6c,d reprinted with permission from [42]. Copyright (2015) Elsevier).

Analogous effects of TANs were reported by Mejía-Centeno et al. [42] (Figure 6c,d). Aguilar-Romero et al. [22] also prepared TANs and employed these as support for V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>. They investigated: The effect of WO<sub>3</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> loading on the TiO<sub>2</sub>-NT surface acidity, the effect of WO<sub>3</sub> on the V<sup>4+</sup>/V<sup>5+</sup> ratio, and its correlation with the catalytic SCR activity. V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NT displayed a higher NO conversion than WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NT and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-NT. In fact, the addition of both V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> and WO<sub>3</sub> is responsible for the increased surface acidity (Brønsted and Lewis) of the TiO<sub>2</sub>-nanotubes. Moreover, they concluded that the morphology of the nanotubes and the metal loading play important roles for the catalyst activity.

Boudali et al. [43] prepared a WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/STi-PILC (Sulfated Titanium Pillared Clay) catalyst for NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR. The results showed that the highest NO conversion can reach up to 100% at 300 °C. Vanadia enhanced the NO conversion over STi-PILC, while no significant effect of tungsten was observed for WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/STi-PILC catalyst. When both tungsten and sulfate were simultaneously present on the surface of vanadia supported STi-PILC, the sulfate species seemed to play a more important role for NO abatement than tungsten.

Najbar et al. [44] synthesized Ti–Sn-rutile for deposition of WO<sub>3</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>. The SCR activity and surface species structure were determined for the freshly prepared catalyst, for the catalyst previously used in NO reduction by ammonia (320 ppm NO, 335 ppm NH<sub>3</sub>, and 2.35 vol % O<sub>2</sub>) at 300 °C as well as for the catalyst previously annealed at 300 °C under 2.35 vol % O<sub>2</sub>/He. A significant evolution of the active species occurred during the use of the catalyst at 300 °C, especially the increase of the oxidation state of vanadium and the decrease of the tungsten content in the surface layers of the catalyst. Changes in the SCR activity occurring upon the different treatments were discussed in terms of dissociative adsorption of water and the OH group's Brønsted acidity. In detail, the dissociative adsorption of water on V<sup>5+</sup>OW<sup>6+</sup> sites appeared to be mainly responsible for the activity at 200 °C, while water adsorption on both the V<sup>5+</sup>OW<sup>6+</sup> and V<sup>4+</sup>OW<sup>6+</sup> sites determined the activity at 250 °C.

#### 2.3.2. Molecular Sieves or Filters as the Carrier

Li et al. [45] reported an enhanced activity of NO SCR and mechanical stability of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst supported on cordierite after acid pre-treatment of the cordierite substrate and the addition of silica. The acid pre-treatment of cordierite significantly increased the BET surface area and pore volume of the catalysts.

Silica increased the surface acidity of the  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, and the strongest surface acidity was registered at the Si/Ti molar ratio of 5/5. Moreover, by XPS analysis, it was shown that the incorporation of Si shifted the V valence from V<sup>5+</sup> to V<sup>4+</sup>, increasing the amount of chemisorbed oxygen, with a positive effect on SCR activity. The optimal catalyst showed a high NO conversion above 90% at 300 to 500 °C, high mechanical stability, and resistance to sulfur and hydrothermal aging.

Kim et al. [46] fabricated three kinds of  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO\_2 supported-SiC catalytic filters by using the rotational coating method and investigated their NO conversion performances. Three different fabrication routes were used in order to find the effective method for the preparation of the best  $V_2O_5$ – $WO_3$ /TiO\_2 supported-SiC catalytic filters. Method-III among the three different methods used appeared to be the most effective one. This method deposited the active component, V2O5-WO3, by the wet impregnation method over titania, then the powder was dried and calcined at 450 °C for 5 h. The resulting preformed catalyst was ground in wet solution conditions with a ball mill and then used for coating the SiC filter. It was demonstrated that by grinding the catalyst with ball milling, the catalyst particle size was lowered and the particles were dispersed in the coating solution (to produce the high catalytic surface area), which diffused into the pores of the SiC filters, favoring the catalyst dispersion and increasing the exposed active sites. The catalytic filter prepared by method-III (with a 50 nm catalyst particle confirmed with SEM) showed the 99.9% NO conversion with the Nx-slip concentration below 15 ppm in the optimal temperature range from 230 to 350 °C. Figure 7a,b display the NO conversions and N<sub>2</sub>O concentration, respectively, over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported-SiC catalysts prepared with the three different methods.

Choi et al. [47] investigated the effect of Pt on the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported-SiC catalytic filter (Pt-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/SiC). The Pt-added catalytic filter lowered the optimum working temperature from 280 to 330 °C for the non-Pt impregnated catalyst (V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/SiC) to 180 to 230 °C for the Pt-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>/SiC. Pt promoted catalytic activity at low temperatures, but increased ammonia oxidation. The Pt promotional effect was believed to result from a high electron transfer achieved on the Pt-catalytic system, as shown in Figure 7c,d.





**Figure 7.** NO conversions (**a**) and N<sub>2</sub>O concentration (**b**) over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported-SiC catalysts, NO conversion over Pt–V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported-SiC catalyst containing different Pt loadings (**c**) and containing different TiO<sub>2</sub> loadings (**d**). (Figure 7a,b Reprinted with permission from [46]. Copyright (2018) Elsevier. Figure 7c,d Reprinted with permission from [47]. Copyright (2005) Springer Link).

Najbar et al. [48] focused on the competition between NO reduction and decomposition over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/Ti(Sn)O<sub>2</sub> catalyst on a Cr-Al steel monolith. Furthermore, they also revealed that the NO conversion was higher than NH<sub>3</sub> over the reduced catalyst. An increase of the pre-reduction temperature was in favor of improving the activity and stability in direct NO decomposition. The reason for the high selectivity of NO decomposition to N<sub>2</sub> was attributed to tungsten nitrosyl complexes via the W-N bond.

Zhao et al. [49] obtained promising catalytic performance over monolithic  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts by impregnating the active components ( $V_2O_5$ , WO<sub>3</sub>, and TiO<sub>2</sub>) and optimizing the relative amounts and the deposition procedure. The active coating layers were stably deposited over the monolithic substrate as revealed by ultrasonic treatment. XPS analysis confirmed the co-existence of  $V^{5+}$  and  $V^{4+}$  species, while the BET surface area was significantly improved after the coating of the monolith due to its porous structure.

According to the data summarized in Table 2, it reveals that SiC or Pt doped SiC filters are the best carriers for promotion, at low-temperatures, of the activity of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts. Indeed, SiC and Pt-doped Si-C filters play an important role in increasing the BET surface area and the dispersion of active components, as well as in the promotion of electron transfer due to Pt introduction. All these factors should be taken into account in the design of new catalysts in the future.

Catalysts	Carries	NO <sub>x</sub> Conversion (Tem./°C)	Surface Active Components	the Key Facts to the Activity	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–100% (225–375 °C)		The well dispersed and isolated vanadium oxide species were found to be weakly active for the SCR reaction but with a high selectivity to $N_2$ .	[29]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	~	_	V and W species do not exist independently on the titania	[30]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	~	- VaOr and WOa	surface (V-O-W connectivity were present on the $V_2O_2$ -WO <sub>2</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> catalysts), which results in a higher activity.	[33]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	90% (>245 °C)	- v205 und v003		[34]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	80% (320 °C)	_	The promotional effect of tungsten may originate from the follows: the influence of the V species or the dispersion of V species ensembles	[23]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–100% (250–360 °C)	_	$WO_3$ species play an important role to form superoxide ions $(O_2^-)$ , which improved the activity.	[35]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> -ZrO <sub>2</sub>	TiO <sub>2</sub> -ZrO <sub>2</sub>	90–100% (290–370 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $ZrO_2$	ZrO <sub>2</sub> mainly promotional role was to change the path-way of NOx reduction and surface acidity of catalyst.	[37]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> -SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup>	TiO <sub>2</sub> -SO <sub>4</sub> <sup>2-</sup>	90–98% (260–480 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $SO_4^{2-1}$	Sulfate stability strongly depends on the loaded metal oxides in addition the reduction property of $V_2O_5$ also changed due to the V-O-W species.	[39]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /Ti <sub>0.5</sub> Sn <sub>0.5</sub> O <sub>2</sub>	Ti <sub>0.5</sub> Sn <sub>0.5</sub> O <sub>2</sub>	90% (>300 °C)	V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> , WO <sub>3</sub> and TiSnO <sub>2</sub>	Activity was closely correlated to the amounts of the Brønsted acid sites: they were in direct proportion to highly dispersed WO <sub>3</sub> . However, too much WO <sub>3</sub> will cover the active sites and lead to the decrease of the activities; About the reduction temperature, which becomes higher due to the V-O-W species.	[40]
V2O5-WO3/ H2Ti3O7	H <sub>2</sub> Ti <sub>3</sub> O <sub>7</sub>	90–98% (325–450 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $H_2Ti_3O_7$	The higher activity can be explained by the following factors: (1) The excellent physics properties that titanic acid nanotubes possess tubular structure, good thermal stability (460 °C) and high specific surface area (314 m <sup>2</sup> /g). (2) TAN as carriers not only significantly increase Brønsted acid sites that light-off conversion at low temperatures, but also increase Lewis acid sites that promote the NO reduction at high temperature.	[41,42]
WO <sub>3</sub> -V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> /STi-PILC	STi-PILC	90–100% (250–400 °C)	~	Sulfate species seems to play a more important role for NO removal activity than WO <sub>3</sub> .	[43]

Table 2. Summary of the supports used for the  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-based SCR catalysts.

	Tabl	le 2.	Cont.
--	------	-------	-------

WO <sub>3</sub> -V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> /Ti-Sn-rutile	Ti–Sn-rutile	90–100% (>230 °C)	~	W species mainly responsible for the oxidation-induced outward vanadium segregation in the vanadia-like species, which was play an important role to improve activity.	[44]
WO <sub>3</sub> -V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> -NT	TiO <sub>2</sub> -NT	90–92% (320–380°C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $H_2Ti_3O_7$	Morphology of the nanotubes and the metal loading (increased surface Brønsted and Lewis acidity sites) play an important role for the catalyst's activity	[22]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /cordierite	Cordierite	90–98%(300–500 °C)	V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> , WO <sub>3</sub> and SiO <sub>2</sub>	For acid pre-treatment of cordierite, which enlarged the BET surface area and pore volume of the catalysts significantly; $SiO_2$ shifted the V valence from V <sup>5+</sup> to V <sup>4+</sup> and increased chemisorbed oxygen. All of them enhanced the activity.	[45]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /SiC	SiC	90–99%(210–360 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $TiO_2$	Smaller particle size and better dispersion of catalyst coating solution that is helpful to the catalyst go into the inside of pores of the SiC filters to improve the catalytic activity by increasing the BET surface area and exposing more active sites.	[46]
Pt-V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /SiC	SiC	95–100% (170–250 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $TiO_2$	Pt promoted catalytic activity at low temperatures but increased ammonia oxidation properties. The promotional effect was believed to result from a high electron transfer of Pt-V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /SiC.	[47]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -Ti(Sn)O <sub>2</sub> / monolith	Cr–Al steel monolith	95–100% (150–200 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $TiO_2$	Increase the pre-reduction temperature was in favor of improving the activity and stability in direct NO decomposition due to the tungsten cations were substituted by vanadium.	[48]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> -TiO <sub>2</sub> /monolith	Monolith	90–92% (420–450 °C)	$V_2O_5$ , $WO_3$ and $TiO_2$	It was important to facilitate the $NH_3$ -SCR reaction that XPS confirmed the co-existence of $V^{5+}$ and $V^{4+}$ and the BET surface area was significantly improved due to the pore structure.	[49]

## 2.4. Effect of Chemical Composition on Catalytic Activity

Shen et al. [50] prepared V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalysts and investigated the resistance toward K and SO<sub>2</sub> poisoning. The calcination temperature of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts was varied between 400 and 750 °C and played an important role for the activity (Figure 8a). Three different weight ratios of SiO<sub>2</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> were used, 3 wt %, 6 wt %, and 9 wt %, respectively, and the loading of K poison was fixed as a K/V molar ratio of 0.5. A different catalytic behavior was observed for silica doped and non-doped catalysts: Over K-poisoned V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts, (Figure 8b), the NO conversion values reached up to 90% to 98% (280–410 °C), with a positive effect observed by increasing the silica loading. On the contrary, the K-poisoned catalyst without SiO<sub>2</sub> showed lower activity with a maximum NO conversion of ~70% between 350 and 420 °C. The outstanding performances of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>–SiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalysts were explained by the catalysts' increased acidity due to the silica presence that prevents K poisoning, forming Si-OK scavenger species. As it concerns the SO<sub>2</sub> poisoning, the authors investigated the effect on the catalyst, V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>, calcined at 750 °C, by adding 1500 ppm to the flue gas. They found that the NO conversion declined sharply by 25% in half an hour, then, by decreasing the SO<sub>2</sub> concentration to 750 ppm over 4 h, the catalyst partially recovered the activity and maintained the 45% NO conversion for the following 3 h.



**Figure 8.** Effects of the  $TiO_2$  gel calcination temperatures on NO conversions over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts (**a**) and NO conversions of K poisoned catalysts (**b**). NO conversion over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst (**c**) and corresponding selectivity (**d**). (Figure 8a,b Reprinted with permission from [50]. Copyright (2018) Elsevier. Figure 8c,d Reprinted with permission from [51]. Copyright (2005) Springer Link).

Liu et al. [51] also studied the effect of SiO<sub>2</sub> additive on the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity and thermal stability of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. Compared with V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, the SCR activity and selectivity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-SiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst was improved after aging at 750 °C in 10 vol % H<sub>2</sub>O/air for 24 h (in Figure 8c,d). The different behavior was explained by the addition of SiO<sub>2</sub>, which plays different roles: Inhibition of the shrinkage of the catalyst BET surface area due to the phase transition from anatase to rutile and the growth of the TiO<sub>2</sub> size; and maintenance of the highly-dispersed W species.

Dong et al. [52] prepared Mn-Ce/TiO<sub>2</sub> (denoted as M) and Cu-Ce/TiO<sub>2</sub> (denoted as C) by the sol–gel method, then a series of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/M/cordierite honeycomb ceramics and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/C/cordierite honeycomb ceramics complex catalysts were obtained by coating V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>, M, and C onto cordierite using the impregnation method. The results indicated that the higher activity originated from the high  $V^{4+}/V^{5+}$  ratio and the large amount of surface chemisorbed oxygen, as well as the high specific surface area increased by the M and C composites.

Li et al. [53] prepared V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and CeO<sub>2</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts by the impregnation method. In comparison with V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, the novel CeO<sub>2</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst exhibited a much better resistance to hydrothermal aging. After aging at 670 °C in 5% H<sub>2</sub>O/air for 64 h, the NO conversion was equal to to 80% (238–573 °C) over CeO<sub>2</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. Such result was attributed to the well-dispersed CeO<sub>2</sub> and W species, as well as to the formation of a new species, Ce<sub>2</sub>(WO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>, due to the interaction of CeO<sub>2</sub> and W. Ce<sub>2</sub>(WO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> prevented the W species' crystallization and TiO<sub>2</sub> phase transition (anatase to rutilo) and sintering. Meanwhile, the existence of the Ce<sup>4+</sup>-Ce<sup>3+</sup> couple provided more oxygen vacancies and improved the surface Lewis acid of the catalyst.

Shi et al. [54] added zirconia to V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst and investigated the performance before and after aging treatment (at 750 °C for 12 h). Compared with V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, ZrO<sub>2</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst without aging was slightly more active at high temperatures, but less active at low temperatures. After aging treatment, the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity of the catalysts was significantly enhanced and exhibited the highest NO conversions and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity (150–550 °C). The following key factors were invoked as being responsible for the improved catalytic behavior: (1) Addition of ZrO<sub>2</sub> improves the thermal stability of ZrO<sub>2</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts and preserves the surface area from sintering, resulting in a better dispersion of V sites after aging; (2) ZrO<sub>2</sub> enhances the strength of the surface acidic groups. Regarding the non-aged ZrO<sub>2</sub>-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst, the decreased activity at low temperatures was attributed to the inhibitions due to ZrO<sub>2</sub>, which decrease the amount of Brønsted acid sites and V<sup>5+</sup> = O active sites, inhibiting ammonia absorption.

Tao et al. [55] focused on the relationship between the loadings of  $V_2O_5$  and  $WO_3$  and the catalytic performance of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts for the SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. The catalytic activity was enhanced by increasing the  $V_2O_5$  loading less than 2 wt %, in agreement with the presence of TiO<sub>2</sub> as the anatase phase (by XRD) and to the high dispersion on the catalyst surface of all the active species (by XPS). Conversely, when the  $V_2O_5$  loading exceeded 2 wt %, the activity began to decline because the high  $V_2O_5$  loading on TiO<sub>2</sub> favored the phase transition from anatase to rutile. On the other hand, the NO conversion was also improved by moderate WO<sub>3</sub> loadings up to 6 wt %. Exceeding such a percentage, WO<sub>3</sub> inhibited the formation of superoxide ions, decreasing the activity.

As shown in Figure 9, Lietti et al. [56] investigated the NO SCR over commercial and model  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ -MoO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. The results demonstrated that WO<sub>3</sub> and MoO<sub>3</sub> increased the activity as "structural" and "chemical" promoters for the catalysts, providing better mechanical, structural, and morphological properties. In Figure 9A,B, the NO conversion and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity values are compared for  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ -MoO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts at different  $V_2O_5$  loadings and constant WO<sub>3</sub> or MoO<sub>3</sub> contents, respectively, 9 and 6 wt %. In both cases, the activity was increased by increasing the vanadia loading, so that the "temperature window" of the reaction was widened and shifted towards lower temperatures. However, the  $V_2O_5(x)$ -WO<sub>3</sub>(9)/TiO<sub>2</sub> samples exhibited higher selectivity in a larger range of temperatures.



**Figure 9.** Results of catalytic activity runs in the SCR reaction (NO conversion and N<sub>2</sub> selectivity vs. temperature) performed over: (**A**)  $V_2O_5(x)$ -WO<sub>3</sub>(9)/TiO<sub>2</sub> samples and (**B**)  $V_2O_5(x)$ -MoO<sub>3</sub>(6)/TiO<sub>2</sub>. (a)  $V_2O_5n = 0\%$  w/w; (b)  $V_2O_5 = 0.8\%$  w/w; and (c)  $V_2O_5 = 1.5\%$  w/w. (Reprinted with permission from [56]. Copyright (2018) Elsevier).

Xu et al. [57] investigated the low-temperature NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> monolithic catalysts in the presence of SO<sub>2</sub>. V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> monolithic catalyst showed a higher NO conversion and broader temperature windows as well as a higher SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O resistance. The excellent performance was suppressed by the extent of NH<sub>4</sub>HSO<sub>4</sub> accumulated on the catalyst surface.

Table 3 summarizes the main results discussed so far on the chemical composition effects of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> based catalysts.

Catalysts	NO <sub>x</sub> Conversion (Tem./°C)	the Key Factors for the Activity	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> -SiO <sub>2</sub>	90–98% (280–410 °C)	The introduction of SiO <sub>2</sub> significantly increased the catalysts acidity and leaded to more V and W	[50]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	42–70% (280–410 °C)	species were exposure on the surface of catalyst by forming SI-OK that was the result of the reaction between enriched K and Si.	[00]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> -SiO <sub>2</sub>	90–98% (500–725 °C)	The addition of $SiO_2$ on the one hand, inhibited the shrinkage of catalyst BET surface area due to	[51]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	<58% (500–725 °C)	The phase transition from anatase to rutile and the growth of $11O_2$ size. On the other hands, the W species remained highly dispersion.	[0+]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	<58% (500–725 °C)		
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /C/ ceramics	52–99% (200–50 °C)	The higher activity origin from high $V^{4+}/V^{5+}$ ratio and large amount of surface chemisorbed	[52]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /C/M/ ceramics	78–99% (200–550 °C)	oxygen as well as BET surface area caused by the M and C composites.	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> / ceramics	10–65% (200–550 °C)		
CeO <sub>2</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–99% (250–550 °C)	The higher activity of $CeO_2$ - $WO_3$ / $TiO_2$ is responsible for the well dispersion of $CeO_2$ and W species; $Ce_2(WO_4)_3$ prevent the W species crystallization and $TiO_2$ sintering and phase transition; The existence of $Ce^{4+}$ - $Ce^{3+}$ couple that provide more oxygen vacancies and improve	[53]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–95% (275–350 °C)	the surface Lewis acid of catalyst.	
1.5%V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -1%WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	96–100% (100–550 °C)	Catalytic activities could improve by increasing $V_2O_5$ loading less than 2 wt%. However, when	
1.5%V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -6%WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	70–100% (100–550 °C)	$V_2O_5$ loading exceeds 2 wt%, the activity begins to decline because high $V_2O_5$ loading on $IIO_2$ speeds up the phase transition from anatase to rutile. On other hands, NO conversion also can be	[55]
$0.5\%V_2O_5-1\%WO_3/TiO_2$	70–100% (100–550 °C)	significantly improved with the increase of moderate WO <sub>3</sub> loadings; however, too much WO <sub>3</sub>	
0.5%V2O5-6%WO3/TiO2	70–100% (100–550 °C)	will inhibit the formation of superoxide ions.	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–98% (550–725 °C)	$WO_3$ and $MoO_3$ could promote the activity not only due to the special structural, but also to the unique chemical property; Compared with the commercial $V_2O_5$ - $WO_3$ /TiO <sub>2</sub> catalyst, $V_2O_5$ -	[56]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -MoO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–100% (500–725 °C)	$MOO_3/11O_2$ catalyst was more active, but less selective.	
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -Sb <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–100% (225–380 °C)	$Sb_2O_3$ -based catalyst showed a higher NO conversion and broader temperature windows as well	[57]
V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	90–94% (275–350 °C)	as fighter $SO_2$ and $H_2O$ resistance. The excellent performance was suppressed by the extent of $NH_4HSO_4$ accumulated on the catalyst surface	[0, ]

Table 3. The relationship between composition and the activity of the  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts.

#### 2.5. Positive/Negative Effects of Different Doping Agents on Catalytic Activity and Selectivity

Addition or doping with other metal oxides or elements, such as F [21,58], Nb, Sb [59], Cu, Mn, and Ce [60–62] is the main way to improve catalyst activity, whereas alkaline and alkaline earth metals (Na, K, Ca, and Mg) [63] deactivate catalysts.

Zhang et al. [21] found that NO conversion was improved by F doping. As shown in Figure 10,  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-F<sub>1.35</sub> (the ratio of Ti/F was 1.35) exhibited the highest NO removal efficiency (82.8% at 210 °C), owing to the improved interaction of WO<sub>3</sub> with TiO<sub>2</sub> forming oxygen vacancies and increasing the number of reduced W species (W<sup>5+</sup>), which play an important role for superoxide ion formation. To further investigate the mechanism, molecular modeling was employed using density functional theory (DFT) and first principles molecular dynamics simulations [58].



**Figure 10.** NO conversion vs. temperature performed over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-F<sub>1.35</sub> and a series of catalysts. (Reprinted with permission from [21]. Copyright (2012) Elsevier).

Ye et al. [59] investigated the enhanced activity of Nb and Sb doped  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalysts ( $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>) that was assigned to the increase of reactive electrophilic oxygen species on the surface of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>. Moreover, the catalysts' deactivation by SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O was inhibited through the addition of Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> and Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>.

Tian et al. [60] prepared Cu, Mn, and Ce doped  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts and studied their performances. The activity was improved because Cu, Mn, and Ce can make the surface of the catalyst moderately acidic, increasing the V<sup>4+</sup>/V<sup>5+</sup> ratio and enhancing the redox performance of the catalyst.

Chen et al. [61] also investigated Ce doped  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts with low vanadium loadings in the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of the NO<sub>x</sub>, and the optimized catalyst showed an above 90% NO<sub>x</sub> conversion from 200 to 450 °C. Additionally, the selectivity could be significantly increased at high temperatures, even at a high GHSV (Gas Hourly Space Velocity) of 113,000 h<sup>-1</sup>, and NO<sub>x</sub> conversion nearly reached 100% in the temperature range of 250 to 350 °C. According to XPS, analysis cerium was present as Ce<sup>3+</sup>, causing a charge imbalance and therefore oxygen vacancies' formation. Such defects increased the amount of chemisorbed oxygen, indicating that more NO can be oxidized to NO<sub>2</sub>. The effect of Ce doping of TiO<sub>2</sub> support on NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/CeO<sub>2</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst was investigated by Cheng et al. [62]. The catalytic activity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> was greatly enhanced by Ce doping, the best NO conversion being achieved at the molar ratio of Ce/Ti = 1/10 (see Figure 11). The crystalline structure also played an important role on the activity; indeed, the catalysts showing predominantly anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> showed better catalytic performance than the catalysts with predominantly a fluorite CeO<sub>2</sub> structure. Moreover, the Ce additive enhanced the amount of oxygen adsorbed on the surface with beneficial effects on the SCR reaction.



**Figure 11.** NO<sub>x</sub> conversion over Ce doped  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts with various Ce loadings (Reprinted with permission from [62]. Copyright (2014) Elsevier).

The activity of alkaline and alkaline earth metals (Na, K, Ca, and Mg) doped  $V_2O_5-WO_3/TiO_2$  catalysts was investigated by Chen et al. [63]. The activity downward trend is: K > Na > Ca > Mg. Several effects must be taken into account in order to explain these findings: (1) Na and K decrease the quantity and stability of the Brønsted acid sites more than Mg and Ca; (2) the surface chemisorbed oxygen decreased in the same order; (3) the reducibility of vanadium species on the Na and K doped catalysts is lower than that on the Ca and Mg doped catalysts with the same alkali metal oxides loadings; (4) Na and K ions also affect the reduction degree of tungsten species, while no effect was experienced by Ca and Mg; and (5) the poisoning by alkali metals of vanadium species appears to be the main factors for  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts' deactivation.

In Table 4, the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR performances of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts doped by various elements (F, Nb, Sb, Na, K, Ca, Mg, Cu, Mn, Ce), as discussed above, are summarized. Based on such results, simultaneous doping with F and Ce could be the most effective way to optimize the performance of new V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> based catalysts due to the positive roles played individually by F and Ce in enhancing the NO<sub>x</sub> conversion and selectivity.

Doping-Agents	$C_o/C_d$ ( $C_c$ )	Reaction Conditions	Deactivated/Recovered Activity (concentration of $H_2O$ and $SO_2$ )	Key Factors for Enhancing SCR Efficiency	Ref.	
F	52%/82.8% (+57%)	$[NO] = [NH_3] = 500 \text{ ppm}, [O_2] = 5 \text{ Vol }\%$ and N <sub>2</sub> in balance, GHSV = 43,000 h <sup>-1</sup> at 240 °C	62%/99% ([H <sub>2</sub> O] = [SO <sub>2</sub> ] = 300)	Improve the interaction of $WO_3$ with $TiO_2$ by oxygen vacancies; Increase the number of the reduced W species ( $W^{5+}$ ).	[21,58]	
Na	100%/20% (-80%)	_		Decrease the quantity and stability of the		
K	100%/30% (-70%)	$[NO] = [NH_3] = 500 \text{ ppm}, [O_2] = 3 \text{ Vol }\% \text{ and}$	~	Reduced catalysts surface chemisorbed	[63]	
Ca	100%/53% (-47%)	<sup>-</sup> N <sub>2</sub> in balance, GHSV = 70,000 h <sup>-1</sup> at 450 °C		oxygen;		
Mg	100%/95% (-5%)	_		Decrease the reducibility of vanadium and tungsten species.		
Cu	72%/98% (+36.1%)	exhaust gas and [NO] = 1200 ppm [ $O_2$ ] = 2 Vol % and N <sub>2</sub> in balance,	~	Form moderate acidity and improve the $V^{4+}/V^{5+}$ ratio on the catalyst surface; Increase the redox performance of the	[60]	
Mn	72%/97% (+34.7%)	$GHSV = 10,800 h^{-1} at 550 °C$		catalyst.		
Ce	52%/95% (+82.6%)	[NO] = [NH <sub>3</sub> ] = 500 ppm, [O <sub>2</sub> ] = 3 Vol % and N <sub>2</sub> in balance, GHSV = 28,000 h <sup>-1</sup> at 200 °C	95%/100% (100 ppm SO <sub>2</sub> and 10% H <sub>2</sub> O)	Increase chemisorbed oxygen; Provide stronger and more active Brønsted acid centers	[60-62]	

Table 4. NH <sub>3</sub> -SCR performances of	V <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub> -WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub> catalysts dope	ed by different agents: po	ositive or negative effects.

\*Note: 1.  $C_0$  and  $C_d$  represent the original and doped-catalyst's maximum NO conversion. 2.  $C_c$  reflect the gradient of NO conversion and it was calculated by the formula:  $C_c = \frac{C_d - C_0}{C_0} \times 100\%.$ 

#### 3. Deactivation or Poisoning Mechanism

In practical applications of NO-SCR by NH<sub>3</sub>, the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts can be poisoned by several species, such as impurities of biodiesel (K, Na, P), urea solution (K, Na, Ca, Mg), and abrasion of the engine (Cr, Cu). As introduced in Section 2.5, alkaline and alkaline earth metals have a negative effect. Following the study of Chen et al. [63], further investigations on alkali ions as well as on other poisoning species have drawn great attention: Hg [64–66], alkali metals [66–70], P [69], Cr [69], Cu [69], Mg [69], Ca [69,71], and As [72]. The main poisoning elements and corresponding reasons for catalysts' deactivation are listed in Table 5.

Deactivating Species	Key Factors	Ref.
HgCl <sub>2</sub>	Reduce the Brønsted acid sites (V-OH) but produce new $NH_3$ adsorption sites (Cl-V-O-H).	[64]
Hg	Transform $V^{5+}$ species to $V^{4+}$ species and consumed the lattice oxygen.	[65]
KCl	KCl could react with V-OH, leading the active sites for $\mathrm{NH}_3$ absorption inactive.	
Hg	The gaseous Hg adsorbed on the vanadia sites reduce the active sites.	-
KCl and Hg	There is the competition for active sites that are partially reduced by gaseous Hg, while others can be increased by delaying the deactivation caused by KCl.	[66]
KCl	Lowering the acidity at different extent by different forms of V species; $NH_3$ adsorption temperature allows to evaluate the acid sites.	[67]
Alkali metal	Decrease the ability of $\rm NH_3$ adsorption but increase in the $\rm NH_3$ desorption rate.	[68]
P, Cr and Cu	Moderate poisoning of the catalysts due to competition between increase the $N_2O$ production and lowering the number of acid sites.	[69]
K, Na, Mg and Ca	Reduced capacity of ab-NH <sub>3.</sub>	[69 <b>,</b> 70]
Са	Can passivate surface acid sites of fresh and bulk W species.	[71]
As	$As_2O_5$ dense layers derived from the ab- $As_2O_3$ oxidized of by chemisorption oxygen on catalyst surface prevent $NH_3$ adsorption and active sites recovery.	[72]

Table 5.	Mainly	deactivating	species and	corresponding	key factors	over V <sub>2</sub> O	5-WO <sub>3</sub> /TiO <sub>2</sub>	catalysts.
----------	--------	--------------	-------------	---------------	-------------	-----------------------	-------------------------------------	------------

Kong et al. [64] investigated the HgCl<sub>2</sub> deactivation mechanism over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalysts. The results showed that HgCl<sub>2</sub> caused an agglomeration of active components, the BET surface area decreased significantly, and the reaction of HgCl<sub>2</sub> with Brønsted acid sites (V-OH) occurred. From NH<sub>3</sub>-TPD, NH<sub>3</sub> chemisorption, FTIR, and XPS characterization data, it was found that V-OH and V = O bonds were affected by HgCl<sub>2</sub>. NH<sub>3</sub> was adsorbed on new sites (Cl-V-O-H) that were not active for NO SCR, and HgCl<sub>2</sub> existed in a stable form bonded to the bridge sites.

Yang et al. [65] evaluated the activity of mercury exposed catalysts by XPS and found that mercury oxidation led to the transformation of the  $V^{5+}$  to  $V^{4+}$  species and consumed the lattice oxygen of catalyst, thus decreasing the activity. In another article, Kong et al. [66] introduced KCl by impregnation of the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts and added Hg by the dry-gas adsorption method. The catalysts modified with KCl were deactivated due to the reaction of KCl with V-OH acidic groups forming -V-O-K and Cl-V-O-K inactive sites. Hg had a weaker negative effect, and it did not cause catalyst agglomeration and increased the amount of chemisorbed NH<sub>3</sub>, thus delaying the deactivation caused by KCl. However, Hg reacted with Cl (from KCl), forming HgCl or HgCl<sub>2</sub>. Then, inactive species, such as -V-O-Hg or -V-O-Hg-Cl, were formed that were able to adsorb NH<sub>3</sub> in competition with the active sites.

The deactivation of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst induced by KCl was investigated systematically via three methods (wet impregnation, solid diffusion, and vapor deposition) by Lei et al. [67]. The deactivation rate occurred in the following order: Vapor deposition >> solid diffusion > wet impregnation, and was mainly attributed to the presence of different forms of V species that reduced the acidity to different extents as previously found by Yu et al. [24].

When KCl was added by wet impregnation, the activity of  $V_2O_3$  species was only slightly reduced, possibly due to the intimate interaction between K and oxygen in vanadium oxides. On the contrary, by the solid diffusion method, the formation of  $V_2O_5$ -K<sub>2</sub>S<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub> eutectic occurred, leading to a very small surface area and a too strong oxidation ability, which were the main reasons for the catalyst deactivation.

Xie et al. [68] assessed the deactivation mechanism by investigating a commercial  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst through exposure to the flue gas of a coal-fired power plant by a transient kinetic analysis that focused on the distinction between the deactivation behaviors of adsorption sites and redox sites. The results showed that the alkali element preferentially poisons the active sites associated with vanadium (V<sup>5+-</sup>OH and/or V<sup>5+</sup> = O) rather than the sites associated with Ti and W. Thus, it was concluded that the poisoning of vanadium-linked species caused decreased NH<sub>3</sub> adsorption and increased NH<sub>3</sub> desorption, negatively affecting the SCR reaction.

The deactivation mechanism of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> ceramic honeycomb catalysts induced by P, K, Na, Mg, Ca, Cr, and Cu was assayed by Klimczak et al. [69]. The catalysts were poisoned by two different methods: (i) wet impregnation of dilute aqueous solution of the corresponding nitrate or ammonium salts; (ii) deposition of the inorganic aerosol particles. The second approach is more realistic as it uses reaction conditions close to the mobile application and it seems to be more harmful. Both impregnated and aerosol deactivated catalysts showed a strong poisoning effect of alkaline metals due to a reduced capacity of absorbed NH<sub>3</sub>. P, Cr, and Cu moderately poisoned the catalysts because there was competition between the increased N<sub>2</sub>O production and reduced acid sites. In Figure 12, the NO<sub>x</sub> conversion curves over  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> (400 cpsi monoliths) are compared [69]. Figure 12a shows fresh, hydrothermal aged and K, Na and Ca poisoned samples; Figure 12b displays fresh, hydrothermal aged and Cr and Cu poisoned catalysts. In both cases, a molar throughput of 3 mmol of poisoning was used and added by aerosol.



**Figure 12.** NO<sub>x</sub> conversion over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> (400 cpsi monoliths) as (**a**) fresh, hydrothermal aged and K, Na and Ca poisoned samples; (**b**) fresh, hydrothermal aged and Cr and Cu poisoned catalysts. Conditions: 1000 vppm NO, 1000 vppm CO, 5 vol.% CO<sub>2</sub>, 8 vol.% O<sub>2</sub>, 5 vol.% H<sub>2</sub>O and balance N<sub>2</sub> at NH<sub>3</sub> slip of 25 vppm and 50,000 h<sup>-1</sup>. (Reprinted with permission from [69]. Copyright (2010) Elsevier).

Deng et al. [70] studied alkali metals' deactivation process of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalyst by using an entrained-flow combustion system. The conclusions can be described as follows, and the activity of the catalyst sample was affected by the fly ash. The order of the poisoning effects of different alkali salts on the activity was Na<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> < K<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> < Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> < K<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> < NaCl < KCl. Both the decrease of the specific surface area and the masking of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> caused the activity reduction, which can be attributed to mechanical deactivation. More importantly, the deposited particles of alkali salts can both coordinate to the -OH on the surface and interact with the lattice oxygen in the V species, which can be assigned to chemical deactivation. All of them can be ascribed to the reduction of the capacity of ab-NH<sub>3</sub>.

Li et al. [71] studied the activity of Ca poisoning  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/ TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts based on the modification of activity, structure, reducibility, acidity, and reaction properties. The results revealed

that the bulk W species and surface acid sites could be passivated with high contents of CaO, leading to CaWO<sub>4</sub> formation. Additionally, the reducibility and surface oxygen species were also inhibited by CaO species.

Kong et al. [72] studied the poisoning of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts by arsenic (As). In Figure 13a,b, the NOx conversion curves over fresh and poisoned catalysts and the deactivation mechanism are displayed. The main reason for catalytic deactivation originates from the following: As<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> would be adsorbed on the surface of catalyst, then oxidized into As<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> by surface chemisorption oxygen. The As<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> dense layers deposited on the catalyst surface prevent NH<sub>3</sub> adsorption and the active sites' recovery.



**Figure 13.** NO<sub>x</sub> conversion over fresh and poisoned  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts (**a**); picture for deactivation mechanism (**b**). (Reprinted with permission from [72]. Copyright (2015) Elsevier).

#### 4. SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O Effects

A discussion about deactivation and poisoning effects on  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts cannot exclude the influence of SO<sub>2</sub> and/or H<sub>2</sub>O for realist applications. Indeed, flue gas emissions from power plants always contain SO<sub>2</sub> (200–1500 ppm) that can be further oxidized to SO<sub>3</sub> by the supported  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. Moreover, SO<sub>3</sub> is corrosive to stainless steel SCR reactor components and readily reacts with ammonia to form ammonium sulfate/bisulfate that deposit on the catalysts, causing deactivation, and on the walls of heat exchangers to reduce their efficiency. Regarding the effects of water, it must be pointed out that significant amounts of moisture, 10% to 30%, are present in the flue gas exiting from industrial combustion processes. Moreover, moisture interacts with the surface of the catalysts and modifies the surface's active sites and the distribution of Lewis and Brønsted acid sites. However, the role of water has not been extensively investigated, so it deserves further attention.

In the 1990s, preliminary investigations about SO<sub>2</sub> effects were reported by Chen et al. [73], who found that SO<sub>2</sub> promotes the activity by increasing the Brønsted acidity, in accordance with the assumption that Brønsted acid sites are the active sites for the reaction. A few years later, the same authors [74] investigated SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2–</sup>/TiO<sub>2</sub> superacid for NO SCR with NH<sub>3</sub>. Since SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2–</sup>/TiO<sub>2</sub> is formed on TiO<sub>2</sub> under SCR reaction conditions when SO<sub>2</sub> is present, the results elucidated the role of TiO<sub>2</sub> support (and SO<sub>2</sub>) in the SCR reaction. XPS and chemisorption measurements along with SCR kinetic results indicated that the reaction takes place by an Eley–Rideal mechanism, on Brønsted acid sites on SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2–</sup>/TiO<sub>2</sub> surface. The catalytic results showed NO conversion is in the range of 96% to 100% at temperatures between 400 and 425 °C and the good performances were explained considering that at 400 °C, about 70% of the SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2–</sup> ions are occupied by ammonia that is active for reactions with NO.

The promoting effect of the sulphate content on the catalytic activity of titania was also reported by Ciambelli et al. [75], who found an enhanced NO conversion without decreased selectivity to  $N_2$ , which was attributed to the enhanced chemisorption of ammonia.

The coupled effect of SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O was investigated by Amiridis et al [76] at 350 °C over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts with variable vanadia loadings. Independently on the vanadia surface coverage, the addition of H<sub>2</sub>O to the reaction mixture resulted in a decrease of the SCR turnover frequency of approximately 40% to 50% due to a competitive adsorption of H<sub>2</sub>O on the active vanadia sites. The presence of SO<sub>2</sub> in the gas phase resulted in a significant increase of the turnover frequency at low vanadia surface coverage due to the formation of surface sulfate species that in the presence of H<sub>2</sub>O, act as strong Brønsted acid sites. However, an excess of water had a negative effect in the SCR by slowing the reoxidation of vanadia.

The reported results on the effect of SO<sub>2</sub> and water thus far were confirmed by Magnusson et al. [16], who investigated how SO<sub>2</sub> affects the NO<sub>x</sub> activity of a V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> urea-SCR catalyst for marine applications. Surprisingly, the authors found that the addition of SO<sub>2</sub> in the absence of H<sub>2</sub>O promoted NO<sub>x</sub> reduction at 350 °C, while only H<sub>2</sub>O gave rise to a decrease in the NO<sub>x</sub> abatement and also an inhibition of the N<sub>2</sub>O formation. No promotional effect by SO<sub>2</sub> was observed at temperatures below 230 °C. Further, long term effects of SO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O were investigated and the NOx reduction remained stable, also after long term exposure of SO<sub>2</sub>. Finally, it was concluded that in the presence of both H<sub>2</sub>O and SO<sub>2</sub>, the catalyst did not show any deactivation at temperatures (250 °C) and/or higher space velocities, the catalytic performance for NOx reduction decreased with time. Therefore, for V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts used at low temperatures, the effects of water and sulfur dioxide must be carefully addressed.

A recent detailed investigation about  $H_2O$  and  $SO_2$  effects has been carried out by Lai and Wachs [77]. This is a perspective study addressing the current fundamental understanding and advances on  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts taking into consideration the main parameters affecting the activity, such as the catalyst synthesis, molecular structures of titania supported vanadium and tungsten oxide species, surface acidity, catalytic active sites, surface reaction intermediates, reaction mechanism, rate determining-step, and reaction kinetics.

As remarked in [77] and as well in the references therein, water inhibits the SCR reaction rate at low (~1%) but does not affect the SCR reaction at high concentrations (>5%). Such an effect arises from (1) competitive adsorption with the reactants (NO or NH<sub>3</sub>) and/or (2) inhibition of the reaction between NO and adsorbed NH<sub>3</sub>. H<sub>2</sub>O increased the concentration of surface NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+\*</sup> species on Brønsted acid sites and such surface NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+\*</sup> intermediates arise from the reaction of NH<sub>3</sub><sup>\*</sup> species with moisture.

Regarding the effect of SOx, the effects of SO<sub>2</sub> and SO<sub>3</sub> on TiO<sub>2</sub> and supported  $V_2O_5/TiO_2$  has received much attention, while less investigation has focused on tungsten catalysts. For  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>, both surface vanadia and tungsten oxide sites contribute equally to the overall SO<sub>2</sub> oxidation reaction to SO<sub>3</sub>.

## 5. Conclusions and Perspectives

In summary, a fundamental understanding and recent advances on the respective role of  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts were reviewed in detail, with special concern to the literature published in the last 20 years. It is generally accepted that WO<sub>3</sub> increases the Lewis acidity and inhibits the initial sintering of TiO<sub>2</sub> as well as helping to form superoxide ions. Concerning  $V_2O_5$ , it increases the surface Brønsted and Lewis acidity and enhances N<sub>2</sub> selectivity. The importance of interaction between  $V_2O_5$  and WO<sub>3</sub> was also revealed. In addition, the relationships between the catalytic activity and synthesis methods, supports, composition, and doping agents were discussed as well. It can be pointed out that alkaline and alkaline earth metals (K, Na, Ca, Mg) as well other elements, such as Cr, As, and Hg, deactivate the  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub>-based catalysts. Especially, alkali metals decrease the ability of NH<sub>3</sub> adsorption, which is a disadvantage for low-temperature activity and selectivity.

The specific surface area of titania plays an important role for the dispersion and interaction of  $V_2O_5$  and  $WO_3$  active oxides. In addition, the support composition influences the activity. For example, the addition of SiO<sub>2</sub> inhibits the shrinkage of the catalyst's specific surface area, avoiding the phase transition from anatase to rutile and growth of the TiO<sub>2</sub> size.

A Pt doped SiC filter is a promising carrier that not only improves the surface acid sites, but also significantly enlarges the BET surface area, the pore volume of the catalysts, and favors high electron transfer, enhancing the absorption of  $NH_3$  and lighting-off NO conversion at low temperatures.

The presence of SO<sub>2</sub> and/or  $H_2O$  on the flue gases must be carefully addressed for practical applications, paying special attention to the experimental conditions that can affect positively or negatively the catalytic performances of  $V_2O_5$ –WO<sub>3</sub> based catalysts.

Considering that  $V_2O_5$ -WO<sub>3</sub> based catalysts are inactive during the engine cold-start, the enhancement of NO SCR at low temperatures (<200 °C), maintaining high selectivity to N<sub>2</sub>, is still challenging for a successful application of such systems for automotive and naval usage. Such improvement could be achieved by doping V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub> based catalysts with new oxides. According with recent data, MnEuO<sub>X</sub>, MnSmO<sub>X</sub>, MnGdOx, MnCeOx represent promising co-catalysts.

**Author Contributions:** W.Z. and S.Q. prepared the original draft of the manuscript, G.P. and L.F.L. equally contributed to the writing, review and editing.

Acknowledgments: Weidong Zhang is very grateful to China Scholarship Council for supporting two years of study at the Institute for the Study of Nanostructured Materials-Council National Research (ISMN-CNR), 90146, Palermo (Italy). The project TECBIA "Tecnologie a Basso Impatto Ambientale per la produzione di energia sui mezzi navali" (progetto n. F.090041/01/X36 –CUP B98I17000680008)" is acknowledged for financial support.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

#### References

- Shaddick, G.; Thomas, M.L.; Amini, H.; Broday, D.; Cohen, A.; Frostad, J.; Green, A.; Gumy, S.; Liu, Y.; Martin, R.V. Data integration for the assessment of population exposure to ambient air pollution for global burden of disease assessment. *Env. Sci. Technol.* 2018, *52*, 9069–9078. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Liu, Y.; Zhao, J.; Lee, J.M. Conventional and new materials for selective catalytic reduction (SCR) of NO<sub>x</sub>. *Chem. Cat. Chem.* 2018, 10, 1499–1511.

- 3. Liotta, L.F.; Wu, H.; Pantaleo, G.; Venezia, A.M. Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> nanocrystals and Co<sub>3</sub>O–MO<sub>x</sub> binary oxides for CO, CH<sub>4</sub> and VOC oxidation at low temperatures: A Review. *Catal. Sci. Technol.* **2013**, *3*, 3085–3102. [CrossRef]
- 4. Roy, S.; Hegde, M.; Madras, G. Catalysis for NO<sub>x</sub> abatement. *Appl. Energy* **2009**, *86*, 2283–2297. [CrossRef]
- 5. Bergmeijer, P. The International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships. In *Ports as Nodal Points in a Global Transport System;* Elsevier: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1992; pp. 259–270.
- Skalska, K.; Miller, J.S.; Ledakowicz, S. Trends in NO<sub>x</sub> abatement: A review. *Sci. Total. Env.* 2010, 408, 3976–3989. [CrossRef]
- Fu, M.; Li, C.; Lu, P.; Qu, L.; Zhang, M.; Zhou, Y.; Yu, M.; Fang, Y. A review on selective catalytic reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> by supported catalysts at 100–300 °C-catalysts, mechanism, kinetics. *Catal. Sci. Technol.* 2014, 4, 14–25. [CrossRef]
- 8. Nakatsuji, T.; Miyamoto, A. Removal technology for nitrogen oxides and sulfur oxides from exhaust gases. *Catal. Today* **1991**, *10*, 21–31. [CrossRef]
- 9. Sorrels, J.L.; Randall, D.D.; Fry, C.R.; Schaffner, K.S. *Selective Noncatalytic Reduction*; U.S. Environmental Protection Agency: Washington, DC, USA, 2015.
- 10. Radojevic, M. Reduction of Nitrogen Oxides in Flue Gases. In *Nitrogen, the Confer-Ns;* Elsevier: Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1998; pp. 685–689.
- 11. Liu, J.; Li, X.; Li, R.; Zhao, Q.; Ke, J.; Xiao, H.; Wang, L.; Liu, S.; Tadé, M.; Wang, S. Facile synthesis of tube-shaped Mn-Ni-Ti solid solution and preferable Langmuir-Hinshelwood mechanism for selective catalytic reduction of NOx by NH<sub>3</sub>. *Appl. Catal. A* **2018**, *549*, 289–301. [CrossRef]
- 12. Crocker, M.; Shi, C. Non-Thermal Plasma Nox Storage-reduction. NOx Trap Catal. Technol. 2018, 384–406.
- Zhang, R.; Yang, W.; Luo, N.; Li, P.; Lei, Z.; Chen, B. Low-Temperature NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO by Lanthanum Manganite Perovskites: Effect of A-/B-Site Substitution and TiO<sub>2</sub>/CeO<sub>2</sub> Support. *Appl. Catal. B* 2014, 146, 94–104. [CrossRef]
- 14. Busca, G.; Lietti, L.; Ramis, G.; Berti, F. Chemical and Mechanistic Aspects of the Selective Catalytic Reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> by Ammonia over Oxide Catalysts: A Review. *Appl. Catal. B* **1998**, *18*, 1–36. [CrossRef]
- 15. Hirata, K.; Masaki, N.; Ueno, H.; Akagawa, H. Development of Urea-SCR System for Heavy-Duty Commercial Vehicles. *SAE Trans.* **2005**, 678–685.
- 16. Magnusson, M.; Fridell, E.; Ingelsten, H.H. The Influence of Sulfur Dioxide and Water on the Performance of a Marine Scr Catalyst. *Appl. Catal. B* **2012**, *111*, 20–26. [CrossRef]
- 17. Guo, M.; Fu, Z.; Ma, D.; Ji, N.; Song, C.; Liu, Q. A Short Review of Treatment Methods of Marine Diesel Engine Exhaust Gases. *Procedia Eng.* **2015**, *121*, 938–943. [CrossRef]
- 18. Chen, C.; Cao, Y.; Liu, S.; Chen, J.; Jia, W. Review on the Latest Developments in Modified Vanadium-Titanium-Based SCR Catalysts. *Chin. J. Catal.* **2018**, *39*, 1347–1365. [CrossRef]
- 19. Tsuji, K.; Shiraishi, I. Combined desulfurization, denitrification and reduction of air toxics using activated coke. 2. Process applications and performance of activated coke. *Fuel* **1997**, *76*, 555–560. [CrossRef]
- 20. Wu, Z.; Jin, R.; Liu, Y.; Wang, H. Ceria modified MnO<sub>x</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> as a superior catalyst for NO reduction with NH<sub>3</sub> at low-temperature. *Catal. Commun.* **2008**, *9*, 2217–2220. [CrossRef]
- 21. Zhang, S.; Li, H.; Zhong, Q. Promotional Effect of F-Doped V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalyst for NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO at Low-Temperature. *Appl. Catal. A* **2012**, 435, 156–162. [CrossRef]
- Aguilar-Romero, M.; Camposeco, R.; Castillo, S.; Marín, J.; Rodríguez-González, V.; García-Serrano, L.A.; Mejía-Centeno, I. Acidity, Surface Species, and Catalytic Activity Study on V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Nanotube Catalysts for Selective NO Reduction by NH<sub>3</sub>. *Fuel* **2017**, *198*, 123–133. [CrossRef]
- Kompio, P.G.; Brückner, A.; Hipler, F.; Auer, G.; Löffler, E.; Grünert, W. A New View on the Relations between Tungsten and Vanadium in V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalysts for the Selective Reduction of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Catal.* 2012, 286, 237–247. [CrossRef]
- 24. Yu, W.; Wu, X.; Si, Z.; Weng, D. Influences of impregnation procedure on the SCR activity and alkali resistance of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. *Appl. Surf. Sci.* **2013**, *283*, 209–214. [CrossRef]
- Dong, G.-J.; Zhang, Y.-F.; Yuan, Z.; Yang, B. Effect of the pH value of precursor solution on the catalytic performance of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> in the low temperature NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO<sub>x</sub>. *J. Fuel Chem. Technol.* 2014, 42, 1455–1463. [CrossRef]
- He, Y.; Ford, M.E.; Zhu, M.; Liu, Q.; Tumuluri, U.; Wu, Z.; Wachs, I.E. Influence of catalyst synthesis method on selective catalytic reduction (SCR) of NO by NH<sub>3</sub> with V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. *Appl. Catal. B* 2016, 193, 141–150. [CrossRef]

- 27. Qi, C.; Bao, W.; Wang, L.; Li, H.; Wu, W. Study of the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst synthesized from waste catalyst on selective catalytic reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> by NH<sub>3</sub>. *Catalysts* **2017**, *7*, 110. [CrossRef]
- Meiqing, S.; Lili, X.; Jianqiang, W.; Chenxu, L.; Wulin, W.; Jun, W.; Yanping, Z. Effect of Synthesis Methods on Activity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/CeO<sub>2</sub>/WO<sub>3</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalyst for Selective Catalytic Reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> with NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Rare Earths* 2016, 34, 259–267.
- 29. Djerad, S.; Tifouti, L.; Crocoll, M.; Weisweiler, W. Effect of vanadia and tungsten loadings on the physical and chemical characteristics of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. *J. Mol. Catal. A Chem.* **2004**, 208, 257–265. [CrossRef]
- Reiche, M.; Buergi, T.; Baiker, A.; Scholz, A.; Schnyder, B.; Wokaun, A. Vanadia and Tungsta Grafted on TiO<sub>2</sub>: Influence of the Grafting Sequence on Structural and Chemical Properties. *Appl. Catal. A* 2000, 198, 155–169. [CrossRef]
- 31. Thirupathi, B.; Smirniotis, P.G. Nickel-Doped Mn/TiO<sub>2</sub> as an Efficient Catalyst for the Low-Temperature SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>: Catalytic Evaluation and Characterizations. *J. Catal.* **2012**, *288*, 74–83. [CrossRef]
- Ettireddy, P.R.; Ettireddy, N.; Mamedov, S.; Boolchand, P.; Smirniotis, P.G. Surface Characterization Studies of TiO<sub>2</sub> Supported Manganese Oxide Catalysts for Low Temperature SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *Appl. Catal. B* 2007, 76, 123–134. [CrossRef]
- 33. Reiche, M.; Hug, P.; Baiker, A. Effect of grafting sequence on the behavior of titania-supported V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub> catalysts in the selective reduction of NO by NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Catal.* **2000**, *192*, 400–411. [CrossRef]
- 34. Zhang, S.; Zhong, Q. Surface characterization studies on the interaction of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for low temperature SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Solid State Chem.* **2015**, *221*, 49–56. [CrossRef]
- 35. Zhang, S.; Zhong, Q. Promotional effect of WO<sub>3</sub> on O<sup>2–</sup> over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for selective catalytic reduction of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Mol. Catal. A Chem.* **2013**, *373*, 108–113. [CrossRef]
- 36. Wang, C.; Yang, S.; Chang, H.; Peng, Y.; Li, J. Dispersion of tungsten oxide on SCR performance of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>: Acidity, surface species and catalytic activity. *Chem. Eng. J.* **2013**, *225*, 520–527. [CrossRef]
- Zhang, Y.; Wang, L.; Li, J.; Zhang, H.; Xu, H.; Xiao, R.; Yang, L. Promotional roles of ZrO<sub>2</sub> and WO<sub>3</sub> in V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-ZrO<sub>2</sub> catalysts for NO<sub>x</sub> reduction by NH<sub>3</sub>: Catalytic performance, morphology, and reaction mechanism. *Chin. J. Catal.* **2016**, *37*, 1918–1930. [CrossRef]
- 38. Herrmann, J.-M.; Disdier, J. Electrical properties of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> EUROCAT catalysts evidence for redox process in selective catalytic reduction (SCR) deNO<sub>x</sub> reaction. *Catal. Today* **2000**, *56*, 389–401. [CrossRef]
- 39. Jung, S.M.; Grange, P. Characterization and reactivity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub> supported on TiO<sub>2</sub>-SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> catalyst for the SCR reaction. *Appl. Catal. B* **2001**, *32*, 123–131. [CrossRef]
- Sun, C.; Dong, L.; Yu, W.; Liu, L.; Li, H.; Gao, F.; Dong, L.; Chen, Y. Promotion effect of tungsten oxide on SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub> for the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/Ti<sub>0.5</sub>Sn<sub>0.5</sub>O<sub>2</sub> catalyst: Experiments combined with DFT calculations. *J. Mol. Catal. A Chem.* 2011, 346, 29–38. [CrossRef]
- Camposeco, R.; Castillo, S.; Mugica, V.; Mejía-Centeno, I.; Marín, J. Role of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>O<sub>7</sub>-nanotube-model catalysts in the enhancement of the catalytic activity for the SCR-NH<sub>3</sub> process. *Chem. Eng. J.* 2014, 242, 313–320. [CrossRef]
- Mejía-Centeno, I.; Castillo, S.; Camposeco, R.; Marín, J.; García, L.A.; Fuentes, G.A. Activity and selectivity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>O<sub>7</sub>, V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>O<sub>7</sub> and Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>O<sub>7</sub> model catalysts during the SCR-NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *Chem. Eng. J.* 2015, 264, 873–885. [CrossRef]
- 43. Boudali, L.K.; Ghorbel, A.; Grange, P. Characterization and reactivity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub> supported on sulfated titanium pillared clay catalysts for the SCR-NO reaction. *C.R. Chim.* **2009**, *12*, 779–786. [CrossRef]
- Najbar, M.; Mizukami, F.; Białas, A.; Camra, J.; Wesełucha-Birczyńska, A.; Izutsu, H.; Góra, A. Evolution of Ti–Sn-Rutile-supported V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub> catalyst during its use in nitric oxide reduction by ammonia. *Top. Catal.* 2000, 11, 131–138. [CrossRef]
- Li, F.; Shen, B.; Tian, L.; Li, G.; He, C. Enhancement of SCR activity and mechanical stability on cordierite supported V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst by substrate acid pretreatment and addition of silica. *Powder Technol.* 2016, 297, 384–391. [CrossRef]
- 46. Kim, J.H.; Choi, J.H.; Phule, A.D. Development of high performance catalytic filter of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported SiC for NO<sub>x</sub> reduction. *Powder Technol.* **2018**, 327, 282–290. [CrossRef]
- 47. Choi, J.-H.; Kim, J.-H.; Bak, Y.-C.; Amal, R.; Scott, J. Pt-V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts supported on SiC filter for NO reduction at low temperature. *Korean J. Chem. Eng.* **2005**, *22*, 844–851. [CrossRef]
- Najbar, M.; Banaś, J.; Korchowiec, J.; Białas, A. Competition between NO reduction and NO decomposition over reduced V–W–O catalysts. *Catal. Today* 2002, 73, 249–254. [CrossRef]

- Zhao, K.; Han, W.; Tang, Z.; Zhang, G.; Lu, J.; Lu, G.; Zhen, X. Investigation of coating technology and catalytic performance over monolithic V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for selective catalytic reduction of NOx with NH<sub>3</sub>. *Colloids Surf. A* 2016, 503, 53–60. [CrossRef]
- Shen, B.; Wang, F.; Zhao, B.; Li, Y.; Wang, Y. The behaviors of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> loaded on ceramic surfaces for NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR. *J. Ind. Eng. Chem.* 2016, 33, 262–269. [CrossRef]
- 51. Liu, X.; Wu, X.; Xu, T.; Weng, D.; Si, Z.; Ran, R. Effects of silica additive on the NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity and thermal stability of a V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. *Chin. J. Catal.* **2016**, *37*, 1340–1346. [CrossRef]
- 52. Dong, G.-J.; Yuan, Z.; Zhang, Y.-F. Preparation and performance of V-W reparation and performance of VW/x(Mn-Ce-Ti)/y(Cu-Ce-Ti)/cordierite catalyst by impregnation method in sequence for SCR reaction with urea. *J. Fuel Chem. Technol.* **2014**, *42*, 1093–1101. [CrossRef]
- 53. Li, Z.; Li, J.; Liu, S.; Ren, X.; Ma, J.; Su, W.; Peng, Y. Ultra-hydrothermal stability of CeO<sub>2</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> for NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR of NO compared to traditional V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. *Catal. Today* **2015**, *258*, 11–16. [CrossRef]
- 54. Shi, A.; Wang, X.; Yu, T.; Shen, M. The effect of zirconia additive on the activity and structure stability of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> ammonia SCR catalysts. *Appl. Catal. B* **2011**, *106*, 359–369. [CrossRef]
- 55. Tao, P.; Sun, M.; Qu, S.; Song, C.; Li, C.; Yin, Y.; Cheng, M. Effects of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> and WO<sub>3</sub> loadings on the catalytic performance of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst for SCR of NO with NH<sub>3</sub>. *Glob. Nest J.* **2017**, *19*, 160–166.
- 56. Lietti, L.; Nova, I.; Forzatti, P. Selective catalytic reduction (SCR) of NO by NH<sub>3</sub> over TiO<sub>2</sub>-supported V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-MoO<sub>3</sub> catalysts. *Top. Catal.* **2000**, *11*, 111–122. [CrossRef]
- 57. Xu, T.; Wu, X.; Gao, Y.; Lin, Q.; Hu, J.; Weng, D. Comparative study on sulfur poisoning of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-Sb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> and V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> monolithic catalysts for low-temperature NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR. *Catal. Commun.* **2017**, *93*, 33–36. [CrossRef]
- Zhang, S.; Yang, X.; Zhong, Q. Cluster molecular modeling of strong interaction for F-doped V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> supported catalyst. *J. Fluor. Chem.* 2013, 153, 26–32. [CrossRef]
- 59. Ye, D.; Qu, R.; Zheng, C.; Cen, K.; Gao, X. Mechanistic investigation of enhanced reactivity of NH<sub>4</sub>HSO<sub>4</sub> and NO on Nb-and Sb-doped VW/Ti SCR catalysts. *Appl. Catal. A* **2018**, *549*, 310–319. [CrossRef]
- Tian, X.; Xiao, Y.; Zhou, P.; Zhang, W.; Luo, X. Investigation on performance of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub>-cordierite catalyst modified with Cu, Mn and Ce for urea-SCR of NO. *Mater. Res. Innov.* 2014, 18, S2-202–S2-206. [CrossRef]
- 61. Chen, L.; Li, J.; Ge, M. Promotional effect of Ce-doped V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> with low vanadium loadings for selective catalytic reduction of NOx by NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Phys. Chem. C* **2009**, *113*, 21177–21184. [CrossRef]
- 62. Cheng, K.; Liu, J.; Zhang, T.; Li, J.; Zhao, Z.; Wei, Y.; Jiang, G.; Duan, A. Effect of Ce doping of TiO<sub>2</sub> support on NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR activity over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/CeO<sub>2</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. *J. Env. Sci.* **2014**, *26*, 2106–2113. [CrossRef]
- 63. Chen, L.; Li, J.; Ge, M. The Poisoning Effect of Alkali Metals Doping over Nano V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>–WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalysts on Selective Catalytic Reduction of NOx by NH<sub>3</sub>. *Chem. Eng. J.* **2011**, *170*, 531–537. [CrossRef]
- 64. Kong, M.; Liu, Q.; Jiang, L.; Guo, F.; Ren, S.; Yao, L.; Yang, J. Property influence and poisoning mechanism of HgCl<sub>2</sub> on V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR-deNO<sub>x</sub> catalysts. *Catal. Commun.* **2016**, *85*, 34–38. [CrossRef]
- 65. Yang, J.; Yang, Q.; Sun, J.; Liu, Q.; Zhao, D.; Gao, W.; Liu, L. Effects of mercury oxidation on V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst properties in NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR process. *Catal. Commun.* **2015**, *59*, 78–82. [CrossRef]
- 66. Kong, M.; Liu, Q.; Zhu, B.; Yang, J.; Li, L.; Zhou, Q.; Ren, S. Synergy of KCl and Hg<sup>el</sup> on selective catalytic reduction of NO with NH<sub>3</sub> over V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. *Chem. Eng. J.* **2015**, *264*, 815–823. [CrossRef]
- Lei, T.; Li, Q.; Chen, S.; Liu, Z.; Liu, Q. KCl-induced deactivation of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst during selective catalytic reduction of NO by NH<sub>3</sub>: Comparison of poisoning methods. *Chem. Eng. J.* 2016, 296, 1–10. [CrossRef]
- 68. Xie, X.; Lu, J.; Hums, E.; Huang, Q.; Lu, Z. Study on the deactivation of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> selective catalytic reduction catalysts through transient kinetics. *Energy Fuels* **2015**, *29*, 3890–3896. [CrossRef]
- Klimczak, M.; Kern, P.; Heinzelmann, T.; Lucas, M.; Claus, P. High-throughput study of the effects of inorganic additives and poisons on NH<sub>3</sub>-SCR catalysts—Part I: V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalysts. *Appl. Catal. B* 2010, *95*, 39–47. [CrossRef]
- 70. Deng, L.; Liu, X.; Cao, P.; Zhao, Y.; Du, Y.; Wang, C.; Che, D. A study on deactivation of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalyst by alkali metals during entrained-flow combustion. *J. Energy Inst.* **2017**, *90*, 743–751. [CrossRef]
- 71. Li, X.; Li, X.-S.; Chen, J.; Li, J.; Hao, J. An efficient novel regeneration method for Ca-poisoning V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> catalyst. *Catal. Commun.* **2016**, *87*, 45–48. [CrossRef]

- Kong, M.; Liu, Q.; Wang, X.; Ren, S.; Yang, J.; Zhao, D.; Xi, W.; Yao, L. Performance impact and poisoning mechanism of arsenic over commercial V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> SCR catalyst. *Catal. Commun.* 2015, 72, 121–126. [CrossRef]
- 73. Chen, J.; Yang, R. Mechanism of poisoning of the V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalyst for the reduction of NO by NH<sub>3</sub>. *J. Catal.* **1990**, *125*, 411–420. [CrossRef]
- 74. Chen, J.; Yang, R. Selective Catalytic Reduction of NO with NH<sub>3</sub> on SO<sub>4</sub><sup>-2</sup>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Superacid Catalyst. *J. Catal.* 1993, 139, 277–288. [CrossRef]
- Ciambelli, P.; Fortuna, M.; Sannino, D.; Baldacci, A. The Influence of Sulphate on the Catalytic Properties of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> and WO<sub>3</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> in the Reduction of Nitric Oxide with Ammonia. *Catal. Today* 1996, 29, 161–164. [CrossRef]
- 76. Amiridis, M.D.; Wachs, I.E.; Deo, G.; Jehng, J.-M. Reactivity of V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> catalysts for the Selective Catalytic Reduction of NO by NH<sub>3</sub>: Influence of Vanadia Loading, H<sub>2</sub>O, and SO<sub>2</sub>. J. Catal. **1996**, 161, 247–253. [CrossRef]
- 77. Lai, J.-K.; Wachs, I.E. A Perspective on the Selective Catalytic Reduction (SCR) of NO with NH<sub>3</sub> by Supported V<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>-WO<sub>3</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> Catalysts. *ACS Catal.* **2018**, *8*, 6537–6551. [CrossRef]



© 2019 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).