

Article

Elevated CO₂ and O₃ Levels Influence the Uptake and Leaf Concentration of Mineral N, P, K in *Phyllostachys edulis* (Carrière) J.Houz. and *Oligostachyum lubricum* (wen) King f.

Minghao Zhuang 1,2 , Yingchun Li 1 , Ziwu Guo 1,* , Yueqiao Li 3 , Wenting Pan 3 and Shuanglin Chen 1

- ¹ Research Institute of Subtropical Forestry, Chinese Academy of Forestry, Fuyang 311400, China; zhuangminghao3@163.com (M.Z.); yingchunli001@126.com (Y.L.); cslbamboo@126.com (S.C.)
- ² School of Environment and State Key Joint Laboratory of Environment Simulation and Pollution Control, Tsinghua University, Beijing 10084, China
- ³ Experimental Center of Subtropical Forestry, Chinese Academy of Forestry, Fenyi 336600, China; liyueqiao132@163.com (Y.L.); pan_ada@126.com (W.P.)
- * Correspondence: hunt-panther@163.com

Received: 5 March 2018; Accepted: 27 March 2018; Published: 10 April 2018



Abstract: Rising CO_2 and O_3 concentrations significantly affect plant growth and can alter nutrient cycles. However, the effects of elevated CO_2 and O_3 concentrations on the nutrient dynamics of bamboo species are not well understood. In this study, using open top chambers (OTCs), we examined the effects of elevated CO₂ and O₃ concentrations on leaf biomass and nutrient (N, P, and K) dynamics in two bamboo species, Phyllostachys edulis (Carrière) J.Houz. and Oligostachyum lubricum (wen) King f. Elevated O_3 significantly decreased leaf biomass and nutrient uptake of both bamboo species, with the exception of no observed change in K uptake by O. lubricum. Elevated CO2 increased leaf biomass, N and K uptake of both bamboo species. Elevated CO2 and O3 simultaneously had no significant influence on leaf biomass of either species but decreased P and N uptake in P. edulis and O. lubricum, respectively, and increased K uptake in O. lubricum. The results indicate that elevated CO₂ alleviated the damage caused by elevated O_3 in the two bamboo species by altering the uptake of certain nutrients, which further highlights the potential interactive effects between the two gases on nutrient uptake. In addition, we found differential responses of nutrient dynamics in the two bamboo species to the two elevated gases, alone or in combination. These findings will facilitate the development of effective nutrient management strategies for sustainable management of P. edulis and O. lubricum under global change scenarios.

Keywords: elevated CO₂; elevated O₃; Phyllostachys edulis; Oligostachyum lubricum; biomass; N; P; K

1. Introduction

Nitrogen (N), phosphorus (P), and potassium (K) are considered essential elements for plant growth [1], but are also the most limiting elements for terrestrial vegetation, especially under environmental change [2,3]. Two important drivers of environmental change, concentrations of atmospheric CO_2 and tropospheric O_3 , have been increasing substantially as a result of human activities since the industrial revolution and will continue to increase in the future [4]. These changes have affected growth and N, P, and K concentrations and uptake in plants, which may influence nutrient cycles in ecosystems [5–7].



Most previous studies that have considered the effects of elevated CO_2 and O_3 on N, P, and K concentrations and uptake in plants, have mainly focused on the response of plant N and P to elevated CO_2 , while other nutrients, especially K, have rarely been investigated [7–9] Studies have shown that elevated CO_2 generally reduces plant N concentration and increases plant N uptake [10–12]. This is partly explained by the dilution hypothesis [13,14], reduction in soil N availability [15,16], nitrate assimilation restriction [17–19], and a change in leaf physiological characteristics (e.g., a decrease in leaf protein and the photosynthetic enzyme RuBisCO) [14]. Compared to plant N, the effects of elevated CO_2 on plant P concentration and uptake are more variable (Gifford et al., 2000). Elevated CO_2 has been associated with increased [20,21], neutral [22,23] and decreased plant P concentration and uptake [24,25]. Similar results have been found in the response of plant K to elevated CO_2 , although relevant studies are rare [7]. Consequently, the response mechanisms of N, P, and K uptake in plants to elevated CO_2 remain unclear [7,21] and warrant further study, especially regarding the complexity of the response of P and K to elevated CO_2 .

In comparison, a few studies have investigated nutrient concentration and uptake in plants under elevated O_3 [26–29]. These studies have shown that the responses of plant N, P, and K concentrations and uptake to elevated O_3 are more complicated than responses to elevated CO_2 [28,30]. For example, several studies have demonstrated that elevated O_3 decreases N, P, and K concentrations and uptake to some extent due to a reduction in nutrient demand by the plants, caused by O_3 -induced inhibition of plant growth [5,31]. However, other studies have shown either an increase [29] or no change in nutrient concentration and uptake [32–34], which have been partly attributed to a defense mechanism against elevated O_3 and an adaptive strategy for plants. Due to the complexity of nutrient response to elevated O_3 , and the lack of information available, it remains unclear how N, P, and K concentrations and uptake respond to elevated O_3 .

In view of the contrasting effects of elevated CO_2 and O_3 on plant growth [35], some studies have concluded that elevated CO_2 and O_3 might drive plant nutrient dynamics in opposite directions [36–38]. However, to our knowledge, there is little evidence to support this hypothesis due to the complexity of nutrient responses to elevated CO_2 and O_3 described above. Moreover, limited information is available on the combined effect of elevated CO_2 and O_3 on plant nutrient dynamics, which may potentially limit our ability to further understand nutrient cycles [30,39]. It is important to understand how increases in CO_2 and O_3 concentrations will affect the concentrations and uptake of N, P, and K in plants, in order to understand nutrient cycle dynamics and predict potential nutrient limitation under future regional climate change [40,41].

Bamboo is the main important non-timber sub-tropical and tropical forest product in China, and is widely distributed in Zhejiang, Fujian, Jiangxi, Hunan, Guangxi, and Yunnan [42]. It also plays important roles in regional water and soil conservation efforts, carbon sequestration, oxygen emission, and climate regulation, making it an important element of terrestrial ecosystems [42]. Among bamboo species, *Phyllostachys edulis* (Carrière) J.Houz. and *Oligostachyum lubricum* (wen) King f. are the two dominant bamboo species in the subtropical zone of China, and are characterized by fast growth rates (60 days), hollow stems and complicated rhizome-connecting stems (ramets). Previous studies have demonstrated that elevated CO_2 enhances the growth of these two bamboo species [43,44], while elevated O_3 inhibits their growth [45]. Moreover, the growth of both bamboo species under climate change is related to nutrient availability [46]. However, it remains unclear how elevated CO₂ and O₃ independently, and interactively, affect leaf N, P, and K uptake and leaf concentrations. Therefore, the objective of this study was to reveal the dynamics of N, P, and K uptake and leaf concentrations in *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* under conditions of elevated CO₂ and O₃. We attempt to answer the two following questions: (1) Do elevated CO_2 and O_3 independently, and interactively, affect leaf N, P, and K uptake and leaf concentrations? (2) Do the responses of N, P and K dynamics to elevated CO₂ and O₃ differ between *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum*?

2. Materials and Methods

2.1. Research Site and Experimental Design

The experiment was carried out at the Taihuyuan Ornamental Bamboo Planting Garden in Zhejiang, China ($29^{\circ}56'-30^{\circ}23'$ N, $118^{\circ}51'-119^{\circ}72'$ E). The region has a subtropical monsoon climate. Average annual precipitation is 1450 mm, and average annual temperature is 15.4 °C.

Open-top chambers (OTCs) that were used in the experiments were built using steel tubes and colorless clear glass, including a filtered air system, vent system and gas distribution system. The details of the OTCs are described in Zhuang [46]. O₃ and CO₂ concentrations were obtained from CFG-20 O₃ generator (Sankang Environmental Technology Co., Ltd., Jinan, China) and steel cylinders of pure CO₂ and from, respectively. The microclimatic (temperature, relative humidity) conditions were measured. We designed four treatments based on a 2 × 2 factorial design based on the local average and observed the peak O₃ and CO₂ concentration of 40 ± 5 nmol mL⁻¹, CO₂ concentration of 360 ± 20 µmol mL⁻¹); elevated O₃ (O₃ concentration of 40 ± 5 nmol mL⁻¹, CO₂ concentration of 360 ± 20 µmol mL⁻¹); elevated CO₂ (O₃ concentration of 40 ± 5 nmol mL⁻¹, CO₂ concentration of 700 ± 35 µmol mL⁻¹). Each treatment was replicated threefold.

Table 1. 2×2 factorial design.

O_{1} (rem class I = 1)	CO_2 (µmol mol ⁻¹)		
$O_3 (nmo1 mL^{-1}) = \frac{360 - 380}{360 - 380}$		685~730	
40~45	Ambient air	Elevated CO ₂	
92~106	Elevated O ₃	Combined elevated CO_2 and O_3	

Experiments were conducted from 10 July to 30 October 2011. During the experimental period, CO_2 was released all day (24 h) and O_3 was released from 07:00 a.m. to 17:00 p.m..

2.2. Plant Materials

Two-year-old bamboo plants of two species *Phyllostachys edulis* (diameter: 18.2 ± 1.8 mm; height: 2.75 ± 0.25) and *Oligostachyum lubricum* (diameter: 12.2 ± 1.3 mm; height: 2.70 ± 0.30 m) were planted in plastic pots in October 2010. The detailed information was described in our previous study [46].

2.3. Biomass and N, P, and K Measurements

At harvest, three plants of *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* were randomly selected from each OTC and the only green leaves were collected for biomass and N, P, and K measurements. Leaves were oven dried at 75 °C to a constant weight. To evaluate N, P, and K concentrations, the samples were first digested in a solution of H_2SO_4 –HClO₄, and the N, P, and K concentrations were determined using Kjeldahl, molybdovanadate, and atomic absorption spectrometry methods respectively [47]. All nutrient measurements were replicated three times within the same treatment.

2.4. Statistical Analysis

The N, P, and K content of leaves was obtained by multiplying the leaf N, P, and K concentrations by leaf biomass. We used one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) in SPSS ver. 17.0 statistical software (SPSS Inc., Chicago, IL, USA) to analyze the differences among treatments. *p* values < 0.05 indicated a significant difference among treatments.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Leaf N, P, and K Concentrations

Different responses of plant N, K, and P concentrations to elevated CO₂ were observed in our study in both *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* (Table 2). Elevated CO₂, in comparison with ambient air, decreased leaf P concentration in both P. edulis and O. lubricum by 19.1% and 23.6%, respectively, which may be ascribed to a dilution effect resulting from an increase in biomass [14]. Compared with ambient CO_2 , elevated CO₂ significantly decreased leaf N concentration (-14.5%) in O. lubricum, which is consistent with extensive previous studies [14,48], and can be largely explained by the carbohydrate dilution effect [12,48,49]. However, the observed increase in leaf N concentration (+18.5%) in P. edulis under elevated CO_2 is in contrast with most studies on elevated CO_2 . This difference may be associated with higher N uptake with increasing leaf biomass growth resulting from an adequate supply of soil N in the present study, and an acceleration of nitrate assimilation [7,12,16]. Elevated CO₂ significantly increased leaf K concentration (+31.1%) in O. lubricum, but decreased K concentration (-30.1%) in P. edulis (Table 2), suggesting a complex response of leaf K concentration to elevated CO₂, as reported in numerous previous studies [11,50,51]. The possible explain was that elevated CO₂ enhances the activity of stomata/guard cells, the operation of which is driven by the availability of K; therefore, the potential difference between leaf stomata and the lower plant parts results in active absorption of K [52]. However, the response mechanism of K concentration to elevated CO₂ remains unclear and warrants further research [53,54].

Table 2. Leaf nutrient concentrations (g/kg DM) (mean \pm s.d., kg DM) of *Phyllostachys edulis* and *Oligostachyum lubricum* in response to ambient air, elevated O₃, CO₂ and combined elevated O₃ and CO₂. Different letters indicate significant differences among treatments (p < 0.05).

		Treatments			
Bamboo Species	Determination Index	Ambient Air	Elevated CO ₂	Elevated O ₃	Combined Elevated CO ₂ and O ₃
Phyllostachys edulis (Carrière) J.Houz.	N P K	$\begin{array}{c} 19.37 \pm 0.46b \\ 1.27 \pm 0.04a \\ 8.41 \pm 0.10ab \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 22.96 \pm 0.41a \\ 0.97 \pm 0.02b \\ 5.88 \pm 0.82c \end{array}$	$21.20 \pm 0.58 \mathrm{ab}$ $1.35 \pm 0.04 \mathrm{a}$ $9.17 \pm 0.89 \mathrm{a}$	$20.50 \pm 0.61b$ $1.01 \pm 0.05b$ $7.34 \pm 0.96bc$
Oligostachyum lubricum (wen) King f.	N P K	$\begin{array}{c} 17.97 \pm 1.07a \\ 1.05 \pm 0.08a \\ 4.25 \pm 0.45b \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 15.37 \pm 0.45 b \\ 0.81 \pm 0.05 b \\ 5.62 \pm 0.20 a \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 18.30 \pm 0.40a \\ 1.07 \pm 0.42a \\ 6.35 \pm 0.39a \end{array}$	$15.90 \pm 0.89b$ $1.06 \pm 0.16a$ $5.60 \pm 0.63a$

Elevated O_3 had a minor effect on N and P concentrations in both bamboo species (Table 2), which is consistent with several previous studies [32–34], but is inconsistent with others [5,55]. The inconsistency in these results could be related to a difference in ozone-resistance level among plants [56], as evergreen species (e.g., bamboos) are more tolerant to elevated O_3 than deciduous species [57]. The possible mechanism affecting the response of N and P in plants warrants further study. Elevated O_3 , compared with ambient O_3 , significantly increased K concentration (+49.4%) in *O. lubricum* but did not change the K concentration in *P. edulis*. This result indicates a difference between the two bamboo species in the response of K to elevated O_3 . These results suggest that increasing K concentration can be regarded as an adaptive strategy of *O. lubricum* that could enhance the plant defensive capability against elevated O_3 [5,21]. Moreover, these results may also explain the higher tolerance of *O. lubricum* to elevated O_3 relative to *P. edulis* [45].

The combination of elevated CO₂ and O₃, in comparison with ambient air, significantly decreased the leaf P concentration (-20.5%) in *P. edulis* and the N concentration (-11.5%) in *O. lubricum*, but increased the leaf K concentration (+31.8%) in *O. lubricum* (Table 2). In addition, elevated O₃ significantly increased leaf P concentration in *P. edulis* under ambient CO₂ conditions, but reduced P concentration under elevated CO₂, indicating a significant interactive effect of combined elevated CO₂ and O₃ on leaf P concentration. Similar results were found for leaf N and K concentrations in *O. lubricum* under combined elevated CO₂ and O₃. These results demonstrate that the nutrient concentrations of both bamboo species under elevated CO_2 may offset the O_3 -induced change, although some differences exist between *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* in nutrient-type response to combined elevated CO_2 and O_3 [36,37].

3.2. Leaf Biomass

Previous studies have reported that elevated O_3 significantly decreased plant biomass by reducing photosynthesis [58,59], while elevated CO_2 acted as a fertilizer to increase plant biomass [16,60]. A similar phenomenon was found in our study. Compared to ambient air, elevated O_3 significantly decreased leaf biomass of *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* by 35.1% and 26.7%, respectively (Table 3), while elevated CO_2 significantly increased leaf biomass of the two bamboo species by 24.9% and 20.9%, respectively. Some studies have demonstrated that combined elevated CO_2 and O_3 does not change leaf biomass as elevated CO_2 alleviates the negative effects induced in plants by elevated O_3 [35,61,62]. A similar result was found in the present study (Table 3).

Table 3. The leaf biomass (kg DM) (mean \pm s.d., kg DM) of Phyllostachys edulis and Oligostachyum lubricum in response to ambient air, elevated O₃, CO₂ and combined elevated O₃ and CO₂. Different letters indicate significant differences among treatments (p < 0.05).

Bamboo Species	Treatments				
	Ambient Air	Elevated CO ₂	Elevated O ₃	Combined Elevated CO_2 and O_3	
Phyllostachys edulis Oligostachyum lubricum	$\begin{array}{c} 73.17 \pm 6.01 b \\ 62.67 \pm 2.28 b \end{array}$	$91.39 \pm 7.14 \mathrm{a}$ $75.77 \pm 1.87 \mathrm{a}$	$\begin{array}{c} 47.54 \pm 3.53 c \\ 45.97 \pm 2.79 c \end{array}$	$80.34 \pm 4.84b$ $58.07 \pm 2.24b$	

3.3. N, P, and K Uptake

We found that elevated CO₂, compared to ambient air, increased leaf N uptake (+47.9%) in *P. edulis* and K uptake (+59.6%) in O. lubricum (Figure 1). This is consistent with previous findings that elevated CO₂ promotes nutrient uptake in plants to satisfy the demands of plant growth [7,11,12]. In addition, it is likely that elevated CO₂ could have various implications on nutrient dynamics between bamboo requirement and supplement among different bamboo species, which have proved in other plants [63]. However, the mechanisms underlying the observed discrepancy in nutrient demand of *P. edulis* and O. lubricum under elevated CO₂ remain unclear and need further research. Compared to ambient air, elevated O_3 decreased significantly leaf N (-28.9%), P (-31.6%), and K (-29.6%) uptake in *P. edulis* and N (-25.7%) and P (-25.8%) uptake in *O. lubricum* (Figure 1), which can be attributed to nutrient-uptake limitation in the plants (including P. edulis and O. lubricum) caused by O₃-induced plant growth inhibition [5,31]. In addition, the combination of elevated CO_2 and O_3 in comparison with ambient air, significantly decreased P uptake in P. edulis (-13.0%) and N uptake in O. lubricum (-18.3%) (Figure 1). This result implies that: (1) leaf nutrient uptake under a combination of elevated CO_2 and O₃ was used to repair O₃-induced plant damage and maintain regular growth [27,38]; (2) the difference in nutrient uptake in P. edulis and O. lubricum further revealed that there are species-dependent physiological mechanisms and adaptive mechanisms affecting nutrient uptake under elevated CO₂ and O_3 conditions. Nonetheless, it should be noted that the combination of elevated CO_2 and O_3 significantly increased K uptake in O. lubricum (+22.1%), which is likely related to properties of K that enhance plant resistance to environmental stress [39,64] and could also explain the higher tolerance of O. lubricum under elevated CO₂ and O₃ as reported by Zhuang et al. from the nutrient perspective [43–45].



Figure 1. Leaf nutrient uptake (g) (mean \pm s.d.) of *Phyllostachys edulis* and *Oligostachyum lubricum* in response to ambient air, elevated O₃, CO₂ and combined elevated O₃ and CO₂. Different letters indicate significant differences among treatments (p < 0.05).

4. Conclusions

Elevated O_3 decreased leaf biomass and nutrient uptake in both *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* to some extent, while elevated CO_2 increased leaf biomass and uptake of some nutrients in both bamboo species. The combination of elevated CO_2 and O_3 did not change leaf biomass but altered certain nutrients in the two bamboo species. The differential response of *P. edulis* and *O. lubricum* to elevated CO_2 and O_3 or combined in terms of nutrient uptake indicated that nutrient management in bamboo forests under further climate change should consider differences between bamboo species (Figure 2). In addition, the nutrient (N, P, and K) supply in our experimental soil was sufficient to either maintain or increase nutrients was still relatively low, especially under elevated CO_2 and O_3 ; however, the utilization of leaf nutrients in bamboo is required for the development of effective strategies in nutrient (N, P, and K) management for sustainable management of bamboo ecosystems under climate change (e.g., elevated CO_2 and O_3).



Figure 2. Significant change in P uptake of *Phyllostachys edulis* and N and K uptake of *Oligostachyum lubricum* under combined elevated O₃ and CO₂.

Acknowledgments: This study was supported by the fundamental research funds for Central Non-Profit Research Institutes (Nos. RISF2014006 and RISF6915) and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (31770447).

Author Contributions: Minghao Zhuang, Yingchun Li, Ziwu Guo and Shuanglin Chen conceived and designed the experiment. Minghao Zhuang performed data analysis and wrote the manuscript. Minghao Zhuang, Yueqiao Li and Wenting Pan conducted the sampling, pre-treatment and experiment work.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no competing financial interest.

References

- 1. Marschner, H.; Marschner, P. Marschner's Mineral Nutrition of Higher Plants; Academic Press: London, UK, 2012.
- 2. Reich, P.B.; Oleksyn, J. Global patterns of plant leaf N and P in relation to temperature and latitude. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **2004**, *101*, 11001–11006. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 3. Yan, W.M.; Zhang, Y.Q.W.; Zheng, S.X.; Shangguan, Z.P. Linking plant leaf nutrient/stoichimetry to water use efficiency on the Losee Plateau in China. *Ecol. Eng.* **2016**, *87*, 124–131. [CrossRef]
- 4. IPCC Climate Change. *The Physical Science Basis: Summary for Policymakers;* Stocker, T., Ed.; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 2013.
- 5. Cao, J.X.; Shang, H.; Chen, Z.; Tian, Y.; Yu, H. Effects of Elevated Ozone on Stoichiometry and Nutrient Pools of *Phoebe Bournei* (Hemsl.) Yang and *Phoebe Zhennan* S. Lee et F. N. Wei Seedlings in Subtropical China. *Forests* **2016**, *7*, 78. [CrossRef]
- Percy, K.E.; Manninen, S.; Haberle, K.H.; Heerdt, C.; Werner, H.; Henderson, G.W.; Matyssek, R. Effect of 3 years' free-air exposure to elevated ozone on mature Norway spruce (*Picea abies* L. Karst) needle epicuticular wax physicochemical characteristics. *Environ. Pollut.* 2009, 157, 1657–1665. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 7. Sardans, J.; Rivas-Ubach, A.; Penuelas, J. The C:N:P stoichiometry of organisms and ecosystems in a changing world: A review and perspectives. *Perspect. Plant Ecol.* **2012**, *14*, 33–47. [CrossRef]
- 8. Piikki, K.; Vorne, V.; Ojanper, K.; Pleijel, H. Impact of elevated O₃ and CO₂ exposure on potato (*Solanum tuberosum* L. cv. Bintje) tuber macronutrients (N, P, K, Mg, Ca). *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **2007**, *118*, 55–64. [CrossRef]
- 9. Yang, Y.H.; Luo, Y.Q.; Lu, M.; Schädel, C.; Han, W.X. Terrestrial C:N stoichiometry in response to elevated CO₂ and N addition: A synthesis of two meta-analyses. *Plant Soil* **2011**, *343*, 393–400. [CrossRef]
- 10. Broberg, M.C.; Högy, P.; Pleijel, H. CO₂-Induced Changes in Wheat Grain Composition: Meta-Analysis and Response Functions. *Agron. J.* **2017**, *7*, 32. [CrossRef]

- Hao, X.Y.; Li, P.; Han, X.; Norton, R.M.; Lam, S.K.; Zong, Y.Z.; Sun, M.; Lin, E.; Gao, Z.Q. Effects of free-air CO₂ enrichment (FACE) on N, P and K uptake of soybean in northern China. *Agric. For. Meteorol.* 2016, 218–219, 261–266. [CrossRef]
- Huang, W.J.; Houlton, B.Z.; Marklein, A.R.; Liu, J.X.; Zhou, G.Y. Plant stoichiometric responses to elevated CO₂ vary with nitrogen and phosphorus inputs: Evidence from a global-scale meta-analysis. *Sci. Rep.* 2015, *5*, 18225. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 13. Gifford, R.M.; Barrett, D.J.; Lutze, J.L. The effects of elevated CO₂ on the C:N and C:P mass ratios of plant tissues. *Plant Soil* **2000**, 224, 1–14. [CrossRef]
- 14. Taub, D.R.; Wang, X.Z. Why are nitrogen concentrations in plant tissues lower under elevated CO₂? A critical examination of the hypotheses. *J. Integr. Plant Biol.* **2008**, *50*, 1365–1374. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 15. De Graaff, M.A.; van Groenigen, K.J.; Six, J.; Hungate, B.; van Kessel, C. Interactions between plant growth and soil nutrient cycling under elevated CO₂: A meta-analysis. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* **2006**, *12*, 2077–2091. [CrossRef]
- Feng, Z.Z.; Rütting, T.; Pleijel, H.; Wallin, G.; Reich, P.B.; Kammann, C.I.; Newton, P.C.; Kobayashi, K.; Luo, Y.Q.; Uddling, J. Constraints to Nitrogen Acquisition of Terrestrial Plants under Elevated CO₂. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2015, *21*, 3152–3168. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 17. Bloom, A.J.; Burger, M.; Rubio-Asensio, J.S.; Cousins, A.B. Carbon dioxide enrichment inhibits nitrate assimilation in wheat and Arabidopsis. *Science* **2010**, *328*, 899–903. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 18. Bloom, A.J.; Burger, M.; Kimball, B.A.; Pinter, P.J.J. Nitrate assimilation is inhibited by elevated CO₂ in field-grown wheat. *Nat. Clim. Chang.* **2014**, *4*, 477–480. [CrossRef]
- Cheng, L.; Booker, F.L.; Tu, C.; Burkey, K.O.; Zhou, L.; Shen, H.D.; Rufty, T.W.; Hu, S. Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi increase organic carbon decomposition under elevated CO₂. *Science* 2012, 337, 1084–1087. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 20. Houlton, B.Z.; Wang, Y.P.; Vitousek, P.M.; Field, C.B. A unifying framework for dinitrogen fixation in the terrestrial biosphere. *Nature* **2008**, 454, 327–330. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 21. Liu, D.H.; Kou, T.J.; Xu, X.F.; Zhu, J.G.; Zhu, X.K. Effects of ozone pollution on phosphorus absorption and distribution in different varieties of wheat. *J. Plant Nutr. Fertil.* **2012**, *18*, 1319–1325. (In Chinese)
- 22. Jin, J.; Tang, C.X.; Hogarth, T.W.; Armstrong, R.; Sale, P. Nitrogen form but not elevated CO₂ alters plant phosphorus acquisition from sparingly soluble phosphorus sources. *Plant Soil* **2014**, *374*, 109–119. [CrossRef]
- 23. Johnson, D.W.; Cheng, W.; Joslin, J.D.; Norby, R.J.; Edwards, N.T.; Todd, D.E. Effects of elevated CO₂ on nutrient cycling in a sweetgum plantation. *Biogeochemistry* **2004**, *69*, 379–403. [CrossRef]
- 24. Teng, N.J.; Wang, J.; Chen, T.; Wu, X.Q.; Wang, Y.H.; Lin, J.X. Elevated CO₂ induces physiological, biochemical and structural changes in leaves of Arabidopsis thaliana. *New Phytol.* **2006**, *172*, 92–103. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 25. Treseder, K.K. A meta-analysis of mycorrhizal responses to nitrogen, phosphorus, and atmospheric CO₂ in field studies. *New Phytol.* **2004**, *164*, 347–355. [CrossRef]
- Broberg, M.C.; Feng, Z.; Xin, Y.; Pleijel, H. Ozone effects on wheat grain quality—A summary. *Environ. Pollut.* 2015, 197, 203–213. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 27. Couture, J.J.; Meehan, T.D.; Lindroth, R.L. Atmospheric change alters foliar quality of host trees and performance of two outbreak insect species. *Oecologia* **2012**, *168*, 863–876. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 28. Liu, L.L.; King, J.S.; Giardina, C.P. Effects of elevated atmospheric CO₂ and tropospheric O₃ on nutrient dynamics: Decomposition of leaf litter in trembling aspen and paper birch communities. *Plant Soil* **2007**, *299*, 65–82. [CrossRef]
- 29. Weigt, R.B.; Haberle, K.H.; Millard, P.; Metzger, U.; Ritter, W.; Blaschke, H.; Göttlein, A.; Matyssek, R. Ground-level ozone differentially affects nitrogen acquisition and allocation in mature European beech (*Fagus sylvatica*) and Norway spruce (*Picea abies*) trees. *Tree Physiol.* **2012**, *32*, 1259–1273. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 30. King, J.; Liu, L.L.; Aspinwall, M. Tree and Forest Responses to Interacting Elevated Atmospheric CO₂ and Tropospheric O₃: A Synthesis of Experimental Evidence. *Dev. Environ. Sci.* **2013**, *13*, 179–208.
- 31. Zhang, W.W.; Feng, Z.Z.; Wang, X.K.; Niu, J.F. Impacts of elevated ozone on growth and photosynthesis of *Metasequoia glyptostroboides* Hu et Cheng. *Plant Sci.* **2014**, 226, 182–188. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Plessl, M.; Elstner, E.F.; Rennenberg, H.; Habermeyer, J.; Heiser, I. Influence of elevated CO₂ and ozone concentrations on lateblight resistance and growth of potato plants. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* 2007, *60*, 447–457. [CrossRef]

- Thomas, V.F.D.; Braun, S.; Fliickiger, W. Effects of simultaneous ozone exposure and nitrogen loads on carbohydrate concentrations, biomass, growth, and nutrient concentrations of young beech trees (*Fagus sylvatica*). *Environ. Pollut.* 2006, 143, 341–354. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Thomas, V.F.D.; Braun, S.; Fliickiger, W. Effects of simultaneous ozone exposure and nitrogen loads on carbohydrate concentrations, biomass, and growth of young spruce trees (*Picea abies*). *Environ. Pollut.* 2005, 137, 507–516. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 35. Dios, V.R.D.; Mereed, T.E.; Ferrio, J.P.; Tissue, D.T.; Voltas, J. Intraspecific variation in juvenile tree growth under elevated CO₂ alone and with O₃: A meta-analysis. *Tree Physiol.* **2016**, *36*, 682. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 36. Abdelfattah, R.I.; Elzawahry, Y.A.; Mulchi, C.L. Influence of atmospheric CO₂, O₃ and soil moisture regimes on carbohydrate and nitrogen contents in soybean plants. *Egypt. J. Bot.* **2015**, *40*, 115–131.
- Couture, J.J.; Meehan, T.D.; Rubert-Nason, K.F.; Lindroth, R.L. Effects of Elevated Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide and Tropospheric Ozone on Phytochemical Composition of Trembling Aspen (*Populus tremuloides*) and Paper Birch (*Betula papyrifera*). J. Chem. Ecol. 2016, 43, 26–38. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Valkama, E.; Koricheva, J.; Oksanen, E. Effects of elevated O₃, alone and in combination with elevated CO₂, on tree leaf chemistry and insect herbivore performance: A meta-analysis. *Glob. Chang. Biol.* 2007, 13, 184–201. [CrossRef]
- Liu, L.L.; King, J.S.; Giardina, C.P. Effects of elevated atmospheric CO₂ and tropospheric O₃ on leaf litter production and chemistry in trembling aspen and paper birch ecosystems. *Tree Physiol.* 2005, *15*, 1511–1522. [CrossRef]
- 40. Minden, V.; Kleyer, M. Internal and external regulation of plant organ stoichiometry. *Plant Biol.* **2014**, *16*, 897–907. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 41. Yang, Q.P.; Ouyang, M.; Yang, G.Y.; Song, Q.N.; Guo, C.L.; Fang, X.M.; Chen, X.; Huang, L.; Chen, F.S. Research on ecological stoichiometry in bamboos: From biological basis to applications in silviculture of bamboo forests. *Chin. J. Plant Ecol.* **2016**, *40*, 264–278. (In Chinese)
- 42. Liu, G.H.; Shi, P.J.; Xu, Q.; Dong, X.B.; Wang, F.S.; Wang, G.G.; Hui, C. Does the size–density relationship developed for bamboo species conform to the self-thinning rule? *For. Ecol. Manag.* **2016**, *361*, 339–345. [CrossRef]
- 43. Zhuang, M.H.; Chen, S.L.; Li, Y.C.; Guo, Z.W.; Yang, Q.P. Effects of elevated O₃ and CO₂ concentrations on the membrane lipid peroxidation and antioxidant system of *Oligostachyum lubricum* leaves. *J. Ecol.* **2012**, *31*, 2184–2190. (In Chinese)
- Zhuang, M.H.; Li, Y.C.; Guo, Z.W.; Yang, Q.P.; Gu, L.J.; Chen, S.L.; Deng, Z.F. Effects of elevated O₃ and/or CO₂ n the membrane lipid peroxidation and antioxidant system in *Phyllostachys eduis* leaves. *Acta Bot. Boteal. Occident. Sin.* 2013, 33, 322–328. (In Chinese)
- 45. Zhuang, M.H.; Li, Y.C.; Chen, S.L. Differences of O₃ stress tolerance between *Phyllostachys edulis* and *Oligostachyum lubricum*. J. Ecol. 2011, 30, 2191–2196. (In Chinese)
- Zhuang, M.H.; Lam, S.K.; Li, Y.C.; Chen, S.L. Elevated tropospheric ozone affects the concentration and allocation of mineral nutrients of two bamboo species. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2017, 577, 231–235. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 47. Page, A.L. *Methods of Soil Analysis. Part 2. Chemical and Microbiological Properties;* American Society of Agronomy; Soil Science Society of America: Madison, WI, USA, 1982; p. 1159.
- 48. Couture, J.J.; Holeski, L.M.; Lindroth, R.L. Long-term exposure to elevated CO₂ and O₃ alters aspen foliar chemistry across developmental stages. *Plant Cell Environ.* **2014**, *37*, 758–765. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 49. Luo, Y.Q.; Hui, D.F.; Zhang, D.Q. Elevated CO₂ stimulates net accumulations of carbon and nitrogen in land ecosystems: A meta-analysis. *Ecology* **2006**, *87*, 53–63. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 50. Loladze, L. Hidden shift of the ionome of plants exposed to elevated CO₂ depletes minerals at the base of human nutrition. *eLife* **2014**, *3*, e02245. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 51. Usue, P.L.; Jon, M.A.; Maite, L.; Amaia, M.P.; Alberto, M.R. Growth and nutritional quality improvement in two differently pigmented lettuce cultivars grown under elevated CO₂ and/or salinity. *Sci. Hortic.* **2015**, *195*, 56–66.
- 52. Penny, M.G.; Bowling, D.J.F. A study of potassium gradients in the epidermis of intact levels of *Commelina communis* L. in relation to stomatal opening. *Planta* **1974**, *119*, 17–25. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 53. Kanowski, J. Effects of elevated CO₂ on the foliar chemistry of seedlings of two rainforest trees from north-east Australia: Implications for folivorous marsupials. *Austral Ecol.* **2001**, *26*, 165–172. [CrossRef]

- 54. Li, P.; Han, X.; Zong, Y.; Li, P.; Lin, E.D.; Han, Y.H.; Hao, X.Y. Effects of free-air CO₂ enrichment (FACE) on the uptake and utilization of N, P and K in Vigna radiate. *Agric. Ecosyst. Environ.* **2015**, 202, 120–125. [CrossRef]
- 55. Yamaguchi, M.; Watanabe, M.; Iwasaki, M.; Tabe, C.; Matsumura, H.; Kohno, Y.; Izuta, T. Growth and photosynthetic responses of *Fagus crenata* seedlings to O₃ under different nitrogen loads. *Trees* **2007**, *21*, 707–718. [CrossRef]
- 56. Li, S.; Zheng, Y.F.; Wu, R.J.; Yin, J.F.; Xu, J.X. Research progress on plant vegetable growth and protection under ozone pollution stress. *J. Agric. Sci. Technol.* **2014**, *16*, 117–124. (In Chinese)
- 57. Li, P.; Feng, Z.Z.; Catalayud, V.; Yuan, X.Y.; Xu, Y.S.; Paoletti, E. A meta-analysis on growth, physiological, and biochemical responses of woody species to ground-level ozone highlights the role of plant functional types. *Plant Cell Environ.* **2017**, *40*, 2369–2380. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 58. Ashmore, M.R. Assessing the future global impacts of ozone on vegetation. *Plant Cell Environ.* **2005**, *28*, 949–964. [CrossRef]
- 59. Li, P.; Calatayud, V.; Gao, F.; Uddling, J.; Feng, Z.Z. Differences in ozone sensitivity among woody species are related to leaf morphology and antioxidant levels. *Tree Physiol.* **2016**, *36*, 1105–1116. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 60. Pinkard, E.A.; Beadle, C.L.; Mendham, D.S.; Carter, J.; Glen, M. Determining photosynthetic responses of forest species to elevated [CO₂]: Alternatives to FACE. *For. Ecol. Manag.* **2010**, *260*, 1251–1261. [CrossRef]
- Lu, T.; He, X.Y.; Chen, W.; Yan, K.; Zhao, T. Effects of elevated O₃ and/or elevated CO₂ on lipid peroxidation and antioxidant systems in Ginkgo biloba leaves. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 2009, *83*, 92–96. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 62. Yan, K.; Chen, W.; Zhang, G.Y.; Xu, S.; Liu, Z.L.; He, X.Y.; Wang, L.L. Elevated CO₂ ameliorated oxidative stress induced by elevated O₃ in *Quercus mongolica*. *Acta Physiol*. *Plant*. **2010**, *69*, 198–204. [CrossRef]
- 63. Zeng, Q.; Liu, B.; Gilna, B.; Zhang, Y.L.; Zhu, C.W.; Ma, H.L.; Pang, J.; Chen, G.P.; Zhu, J.G. Elevated CO₂ effects on nutrient competition between a C₃ crop (*Oryza sativa* L.) and a C₄ weed (*Echinochloa crusgalli* L.). *Nutr. Cycl. Agroecosyst.* **2011**, *89*, 3–4. [CrossRef]
- 64. Nie, G.Y.; Tomasevic, M.; Baker, N.R. Effects of ozone on the photosynthetic apparatus and leaf proteins during leaf development in plants. *Plant Cell Environ.* **1993**, *16*, 643–651. [CrossRef]



© 2018 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).