



Supplementary Material

Assessing the influence of socioeconomic status and air pollution levels on the public perception of local air quality in a Mexico-US border city.



Figure S1. Geographic location of monitoring stations, centroids of each AGEB and buffers used for the IDW method.



Figure S2. Principal components analysis scree plot as selection criteria.

Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2020, 17, 4616; doi:10.3390/ijerph17134616

Variables	KMO
Pop. >18 years of age without post-basic education	0.87
Pop. >18 years of age without employment	0.94
Pop. Without health insurance (public/private)	0.83
Number of households headed by women	0.82
Number of people per room (overcrowding proxy)	0.42
Households without a car	0.83
Overall	0.85

Table S1. Results of the Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) for measuring adequacy sampling.

Table S2. Results of the Kruskal-Wallis H test for individual and AGEB level variables with responses of air quality perception. Consist of the chi-square test statistic with ties (X²), the degrees of freedom (df) and the significance level (p-value).

Variable	X ² with ties ^a	df	p- value
Age (Four categories: 18 to 30 years old, 31 to 43 years old, 44 to 56 years old, more than 57 years old)	0.262	3	0.967
Sex (Females and males)	1.216	1	0.270
Education level (Lower or equal to elementary school,	2.904	4	0.574
middle school, high school and higher or equal to			
bachelor's degree)			
Average household monthly income (Five categories)	9.575	4	0.048*
Health insurance status (Two categories:	2.598	1	0.107
public/private and without health insurance)			
Sources to check air quality (Media and visible signs of	0.088	1	0.766
pollution)			
Frequent respiratory symptoms in at least one	0.349	1	0.554
household member (Affected and non-affected			
household members)			
Knowledge of health effects related to air pollution	2.615	1	0.105
(only respiratory diseases and report of respiratory			
diseases, cancer, neurological and metabolic diseases)			
Sources of pollution (Four categories: fixed, mobile,	0.312	3	0.701
area sources and natural sources)			
Perception at the neighbourhood level	9.308	3	0.025*
Estimated exposure areas by exceedance in days (Four	0.513	3	0.916
categories: moderate, high, very high, extremely high)			

^a Kruskal-Wallis H test is a non-parametric statistical approach used to compare differences between two or more groups of an independent variables on an ordered dependent variable. The test does not assume population normality, nor homogeneity of variance.

*A statistically significant difference in perception between the categories of the independent variable at 0.05

Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2020, 17, 4616



Circular buffers to assess proximity to stationary sources of air pollution and association with air quality perception in Mexicali.

*Localized industries correspond to those with more than 30 employees and that belong to subsectors 221, 311-313, 321-327, 331-336 and 339 accord the North Amercican Industry Classification System. We constructed 1mile radius circular buffers centred at the residence place of the respondents.

Figure S3. Circular buffers to assess proximity to industries and perception of air quality. 1-mile radius buffers were centered at the respondent's place of residence. The number of industries within each buffer was calculated. We use the "queen" proximity matrix.



Figure S4. Responses of perceived air quality by exposure areas.



Figure S5. Perceived changes on air quality in the last four years in Mexicali. Survey 2019.



Bivariate local Moran's I for spatial autocorrelation between the presence of industries close to the esidence's place and perception of air quality .

*Localized industries correspond to those with more than 30 employees and that belong to subsectors 221, 311-313, 321-327, 331-336 and 339 accord the North Amercican Industry Classification System. We constructed 1mile radius circular buffers centred at the residence place of the respondents.

Figure S6. Bivariate local Moran's Index for spatial autocorrelation between the presence of industries nearby the residence's place and perception of air quality. Localized industries correspond to those with more than 30 employees, and that belong to subsectors 221, 311-313, 321-327, 331-336 and 339 according to the North American Industry Classification System.

Perception of air quality N=199								
	Improved (I), Unchanged (U),			Good	(1), Regu	lar (2), Po	oor (3),	
	W	orsened (W)			Very p	oor (4)		
Variables	Ι	U	W	1	2	3	4	Total
Age								
18 to 30	6 (9.68)	9 (14 52)	47	4	28	24	6	62
years old	0 (9.00)) (14.32)	(75.81)	(6.45)	(45.16)	(38.71)	(9.68)	(31.16)
31 to 43	3 (5 17)	11	44	3	27	17	11	58
years old	5 (5.17)	(18.97)	(75.86)	(5.17)	(46.55)	(29.31)	(18.97)	(29.15)
44 to 56	5 (9.80)	7 (13 73)	39	2	18	21	10	51
years old	5 (5.00)	7 (10.70)	(76.47)	(3.92)	(35.29)	(41.18)	(19.61)	(25.63)
≥57 years	0 (0.00)	6 (21.43)	22	6	12	9	1	28
old	0 (0.00)	0 (21.40)	(78.57)	(21.43)	(42.86)	(32.14)	(3.57)	(14.07)
Sex								
Males	5 (676)	16	53	8	26	31	9	74
Whites	0 (0.70)	(21.62)	(72.62)	(10.81)	(35.14)	(41.89)	(12.16)	(37.19)
Females	9 (7.90)	17	99	7	59	40	19	125
i cinaico) (1.90)	(13.60)	(79.20)	(5.60)	(47.2)	(32.00)	(15.20)	(62.81)
Education lev	vel							
≤Elementary	1 (4 55)	7 (31.81)	14	4	9	6	3	22
school	1 (1.00)	7 (01.01)	(63.64)	(18.18)	(40.91)	(27.71)	(13.64) (11.06)	
Middle	3 (9.09)	6 (18 18)	24	1	18	10	4	33
school	0 (5.05)	0 (10.10)	(72.73)	(3.03)	(54.55)	(30.30)	(12.12)	(16.58)
High school	6 (1071)	7 (12.50)	43	3	24	22	7	56
i iigii sensor	0 (10.71)	/ (12.00)	(76.79)	(5.36)	(42.86)	(39.29)	(12.50)	(28.14)
≥Bachelor's	4 (4.55)	13	71	7	34	33	14	88
degree	1 (100)	(14.77)	(80.68)	(7.96)	(38.63)	(37.50)	(15.91)	(44.22)
Average mon	Average monthly household income (2019 USD)							
< \$354.9	8 (10.53)	19	49	7	35	24	10	76
4	• ()	(25.00)	(64.47)	(9.21)	(46.05)	(31.28)	(13.16)	(38.19)
From \$354.9	4 (7.41)	5 (9.26)	45	4	22	20	8	54
to \$605.4		- (/	(83.33)	(7.41)	(40.74)	(37.04)	(14.81)	(27.14)
From \$605.4	1 (2.50)	5 (12.50)	34	3	19	13	5	40
to \$1352		()	(85.00)	(7.50)	(47.50)	(32.50)	(12.50)	(20.10)
From \$1352	0 (0.00)	2 (20.00)	8	0	5	2	3	10
to \$1825		()	(80.00)	(0.00)	(50.00)	(20.00)	(30.00)	(5.03)
>\$1825	1 (5.26)	2 (10.53)	16	1	4	12	2	19
	, 1	• • •	(84.21)	(5.26)	(21.05)	(63.16)	(10.53)	(9.55)
Health insura	ance (public	or private)	104	4.4	50		00	1 124
With health	11 (6.43)	26	134	11	73	64	23	1/1
insurance	. /	(15.20)	(78.36)	(6.43)	(42.69)	(37.43)	(13.45)	(85.93)
vvitnout	3 (10.71)	7 (25.00)	18	4	12	/ (DE 00)	5	28 (14.07)
nearth ins.	1	·	(64.29)	(14.29)	(42.89)	(25.00)	(17.86)	(14.07)
Sources to ch	eck air qual	117						

Table S3. Socioeconomic characteristics, health concerns and knowledge of health effects by the perceived air quality, Mexicali, 2019. Percentages of responses in parenthesis.

Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health 2020, 17, 4616

TV. internet.			17	93	12	50	40	18	120
newspaper	10	(8.33)	(14.17)	(77.50)	(10.00)	(41.67)	(33.33)	(15.00)	(60.30)
Sensorial			16	59	3	35	31	10	79
perception	4	(5.06)	(20.25)	(74.68)	(3.80)	(44.30)	(39.24)	(12.66)	(39.70)
Frequent resp	irat	orv svm	ptoms in at	least one	e househo	old meml	ber	(()
1 1			17	66	6	34	35	14	110
Yes	6	(6.74)	(19.10)	(74.16)	(6.74)	(38.20)	(39.33)	(15.73)	(55.28)
			16	86	9	51	36	14	89
No	8	(7.27)	(14.55)	(78.18)	(8.18)	(46.36)	(32.73)	(12.73)	(44.72)
Knowledge o	f he	alth dise	eases relate	d to air po	ollution (report re	spiratory	diseases	or other
such as chroni	ic di	seases, c	ancer, neur	ological a	nd metal	olic disea	ases)		
Respiratory		, 	31	128	13	74	62	23	172
diseases	13	(7.56)	(18.02)	(74.42)	(7.56)	(43.02)	(36.05)	(13.37)	(86.43)
Chronic				24	2	11	9	5	27
diseases	1	(3.70)	2 (7.41)	(88.89)	(7.41)	(40.74)	(33.33)	(18.52)	(13.57)
Pollution sou	rces			()		()	()	()	()
			15	91	10	44	42	16	112
Stationary	6	(5.36)	⁶⁾ (13.39) (81.25) (8.93) (39.29) (37.50) ((14.29)	(56.28)				
		32	10	4	1	24	18	3	46
² Mobile	(6	59.57)	(21.74)	(8.70)	(2.17)	(52.17)	(39.13)	(6.53)	(23.12)
	``	26		4	2	16	10	8	36
³ Area	(7	72.22)	6 (16.67)	(28.57)	(5.56)	(44.44)	(27.78)	(22.22)	(18.09)
a	ì	, ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	a (10.00)	0	2	1	1	1	5
⁴Natural	3	(60.00)	2 (40.00)	(0.00)	(40.00)	(20.00)	(20.00)	(20.00)	(2.51)
— • •			33	152	15	`85 ´	71	28	199
Total	14	(7.04)	(16.58)	(76.38)	(7.54)	(42.71)	(35.68)	(14.07)	

¹Stationary source: electric power generation, food processing plants and heavy industrial sources. ²Mobile source: automobiles, trucks, buses. ³Area source: commercial and services establishments, dry cleaners, gas stations, agricultural areas, unpaved roads, burning of household waste, fireworks. ⁴Natural: dust storms, wind erosion, wildfires.

		Odds-ratio and 95% C	Confidence interval		
Variable	Description	Socio-economic attributes	Knowledge of health effects	Local perception	Var. at the AGEB level
	< US \$354.9 (Ref)				
	From US \$354.9 to US \$605.4	0.39** [0.16-0.97]	0.39** [0.17-0.93]	0.40** [0.17-0.97]	0.36** [0.15-0.90]
Average monthly household	From US \$605.4 to US \$1352	0.28** [0.09-0.89]	0.36** [0.13-0.97]	0.35** [0.13-0.95]	0.30** [0.11-0.85]
income (2019 USD) ^a	From US \$1352 to US \$1825	0.32 [0.05-1.92]	0.44 [0.09-2.20]	0.47 [0.09-2.41]	0.42 [0.08-2.20]
	> US \$1825	0.28 [0.06-1.30]	0.43 [0.11-1.67]	0.53 [0.13-2.18]	0.47 [0.11-2.02]
	≤ Elementary school (Ref)				
	Middle school	0.83 [0.25-2.75]			
Education level	High school	0.67 [0.20-2.22]			
	Bachelor's degree	0.82 [0.24-2.85]			
	Graduate school	1.41 [0.26-7.73]			
Say	Male (Ref)				
	Female	0.69 [0.34-1.39]			
	18 to 30 years old (Ref)				
4 70	31 to 43 years old	0.76 [0.31-1.86]			
Age	44 to 56 years old	0.87 [0.32-2.35]			
	≥57 years old	0.51 [0.15-1.73]			
^b Knowledge of health effects	No (Ref)				
related to air pollution	Yes		0.50 [0.13-1.85]	0.48 [0.13-1.84]	0.51 [0.13-1.95]
	Good (Ref)				
Perception of air quality in	Regular			0.42 [0.14-1.23]	0.41 [0.14-1.21]
individual's residence Poor Very poor				0.21*** [0.07-0.67]	0.21*** [0.07-0.68]
			0.30* [0.08-1.14]	0.32* [0.08-1.21]	
	Moderate (Ref)				
	High				1.22 [0.44-3.39]

	Table S4. Estimates for	perceived chang	ges in air quality	(worsened, uncha	inged, improved).
--	-------------------------	-----------------	--------------------	------------------	-------------------

^c Exposure areas by	Very high				1.27 [0.43-3.78]
exceedance days of PM10	Extremely high				1.58 [0.42-5.91]
concentrations					
^d Social vulnerability	Medium-High SES index				
(through SES index)	(Ref)				
	Low SES index				0.58 [0.24-1.37]
N=199		LLV= -131.29	LLV=-132.09	LLV=-128.44	LLV=-127.54
		LrChi2=0.43	LrChi2=0.05	LrChi2=0.03	LrChi2=0.07
^e Equality coefficient test throu	gh the response	Chi2(12)=2.08	Chi2(5)=0.17	Chi2(8)=0.14	Chi2(12)=2.37
categories		Prob>chi2=0.72	Prob>chi2=0.92	Prob>chi2=0.98	Prob>chi2=0.79

^a The exchange rate for when the survey was conducted was 1 USD = 19.16 Mexican pesos. World Bank's collection of development indicators (WDI, 2019).

^b "Yes" if respondents relate chronic diseases such as cancer, neurological or metabolic diseases with air pollution

^cThe categories of days with exceedances are based on the WHO guideline (50 µg m³)

^dSocial vulnerability was categorized as very high when the SES index was less than or equal to 75th centile.

^e This test is a likelihood ratio test for ordinal response models proposed by Wolfe and Gould (1998), the result indicates that the proportional odds assumption was no violated.

*** for p<0.001, **p<0.05, *p<0.01

Table S5. Demographic characteristics of the sample and information from the 2015 Census for the municipality of Mexicali.

Variables	Sample N (%)	Total Mexicali, 2015 Census (%)
Age*		
19 to 29	56	170,041
years old	(28.14)	(26.43)
30 to 44	71	222,159
years old	(35.68)	(34.54)
45 to 59	53	94,665
years old	(26.63)	(14.71)
≥60 years	19	95,121
old	(9.55)	(14.78)

Sex		
Malaa	74	317,310
Males	(37.19)	(49.35)
Eamalas	125	325,623
remales	(62.81)	(50.65)
Education lev	vel*	
≤Elementary	22	155,822
school	(11.06)	(21.36)
Middle	33	231,325
school	(16.58)	(31.71)
High school	56	181,281
	(28.14)	(24.85)
≥Bachelor's	88	159,688
degree	(44.22)	(21.89)

* The categories definitions are different from the ones in the 2015 Census. We considered the population with a technical degree in the higher category. The remaining 0.19 in the percentages of the census corresponds to a population that does not specified their education level.